## **COTTLE COUNTY APPRAISAL DISTRICT**

# PLAN FOR PERIODIC REAPPRAISAL

2025/2026

Adopted by the Board of Directors on

like to be the state of the later of the lat

.1 <sup>±</sup>

## **Table of Contents**

#### Item:

Executive Summary
Plan for Periodic Reappraisal Requirement

Revaluation Decision Tax Year 2025

Tax Year 2026

Performance Analysis

Ratio Study Results

Appraisal Accuracy

Appraisal Uniformity

Analysis of Available Resources

Staffing for Reappraisal Year

Proposed Budget for 2025

**Existing Practices** 

Information Systems (IS) Support

Existing Data and Maps

Planning and Organization

Calendar of Key Events – 2025

Calendar of Key Events – 2026

Performance Objectives

Target Completion Dates – 2025

Target Completion Dates – 2026

Production Standards for Field Activities

Mass Appraisal System

Forms and Procedures

CAMA System Revisions as Required

Real Property Valuations

Personal Property Valuations

**Noticing Process** 

**Hearing Process** 

## Data Collection Requirements by Tax Year

**New Construction** 

Remodeling

Reinspection of Problematic Markets

Reinspection of Universe of Properties on Specific Cycles

Field or Office Verification of Sales Data and Property Characteristics

## Pilot Study by Tax Year

Test New/Revised Mass Appraisal Methods

Ratio Studies by Market Areas

Test Accuracy and Reliability in Market Areas

## Valuation by Tax Year

Market Analysis

Model Development

Model Calibration

Calculation of Preliminary Values

Test Values for Accuracy and Uniformity

Description of Valuation Methods by Property Type

Approaches to Value

**Special Valuation Process** 

## The Mass Appraisal Report by Tax Year

Scope of Work

Compliant with STANDARD RULE 6-8 of USPAP

Signed Certification by Chief Appraiser as Required

#### Value Defense

Informal Appeals

Formal Appeals

Burden of Proof Evidence for Market Value and Equity

## Computer Assisted Mass Appraisal

## **ARB Appeal Procedures**

## Written Reappraisal Plan

Planning a Reappraisal

Steps in a Reappraisal

Residential, Commercial, Rural, & Personal Property 2025/2026 Reappraisal Plan

2-Year Cycle: Area One and Area Two Annual Ratio Reports Organization 2025 Reappraisal Schedule Scope of Work Schedule 2025 & 2026 2025 Reappraisal Schedule 2026 Reappraisal Schedule The page intentionally fer frank-

.

5

t .

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

#### TAX CODE REQUIREMENT:

Passage of Senate Bill 1652 amended Section 6.05 of the Texas Property Tax code by adding Subsection (i) to read as follows:

(i) To ensure adherence with generally accepted appraisal practices, the board of directors of an appraisal district shall develop biennially a written plan for the periodic reappraisal of all property within the boundaries of the district according to the requirements of Section 25.18 and shall hold a public hearing to consider the proposed plan. Not later than the 10<sup>th</sup> day before the date of the hearing, the secretary of the board shall deliver to the presiding officer of the governing body of each taxing unit participating in the district a written notice of the date, time, and place of the hearing. Not later than September 15 of each even-numbered year, the board shall complete its hearings, make any amendments, and by resolution finally approve the plan. Copies of the approved plan shall be distributed to the presiding officer of the governing body of each taxing unit participating in the district and to the Comptroller within sixty (60) days of the approval date.

## Plan for Periodic Reappraisal Requirement:

Senate Bill 1652 amends Section 25.18, Subsections (a) and (b) to read as follows:

- (a) Each appraisal office shall implement the Plan for Periodic Reappraisal of property approved by the board of directors under Section 6.05(i).
- (b) The plan shall provide for the following reappraisal activities for all real and personal property in the district at least once every three years:
  - identifying properties to be appraised through physical inspection or by other reliable means of identification, including deeds or other legal documentation, aerial photographs, land-based photographs, surveys, maps, and property sketches;
  - 2. identifying and updating relevant characteristics of each property in the appraisal records;
  - 3. defining market areas in the district;
  - 4. identifying property characteristics that affect property value in each market area, including:
    - a. the location and market area of property;
    - b. physical attributes of property, such as size, age, and condition:
    - c. legal and economic attributes; and

- d. easements, covenants, leases, reservations, contracts, declarations, special assessments, ordinances, or legal restrictions;
- 5. developing an appraisal model that reflects the relationship among the property characteristics affecting value in each market area and determines the contribution of individual property characteristics;
- 6. applying the conclusions reflected in the model to the characteristics of the properties being appraised; and
- 7. reviewing the appraisal results to determine value.

### SCOPE OF RESPONSIBILITY

The Cottle County Appraisal District has prepared and published this reappraisal plan and appraisal report to provide the Board of Directors, taxing entities, and taxpayers with a better understanding of the district's responsibilities and activities.

The Cottle County Appraisal District is a political subdivision of the State of Texas created effective January 1, 1980. The provisions of the Texas Property Tax Code govern the legal, statutory, and administrative requirements of the appraisal district. The Board of Directors, appointed by the taxing units within the boundaries of Cottle County, constitutes the district's governing body. The chief appraiser, appointed by the Board of Directors, is the chief administrator and chief executive officer of the appraisal district.

The appraisal district is responsible for local property tax appraisal and administration for all taxing entities in the county. The taxing entities are as follows:

Cottle County
Paducah ISD
Gateway Groundwater Conservation District
City of Paducah
Quanah ISD
Childress ISD

Each taxing unit sets its own tax rate to generate revenue to pay for such things as police and fire protection, public schools, road and street maintenance, courts, water and sewer systems, and other public services. Property appraisals and estimated values by the appraisal district allocate the year's tax burden on the basis of each taxable property's market value. The appraisal district also determines eligibility for various types of property tax exemptions such as those for homeowners, the elderly, disabled veterans, charitable or religious organizations and agricultural productivity valuation.

Except as otherwise provided by the Property Tax Code, all taxable property is appraised at its "market value" as of January 1 of the tax year. Under the tax code, "market value" is defined as the price at which a property would transfer for cash or its equivalent under prevailing market conditions if:

- exposed for sale in the open market with a reasonable time for the seller to find a purchaser;
- both the seller and the buyer know of all the uses and purposes to which the property is adapted and for which it is capable of being used and of the enforceable restrictions on its use, and;
- both the seller and buyer seek to maximize their gains and neither is in a position to take advantage of the other.

The Texas Property Tax Code defines special appraisal provisions for the valuation of residential homestead property (Sec. 23.23), productivity (Sec. 23.41), real property inventory (Sec. 23.12), dealer inventory (Sec. 23.121, 23.124, 23.1241, nominal (sec. 23.18) or restricted use properties (Sec. 23.83) and allocation of interstate property (Sec. 23.03). The owner of real property inventory may elect to have the inventory appraised at its market value as of September 1st of the year preceding the tax year to which the

appraisal applies by filing an application with the chief appraiser requesting that the inventory be appraised as of September 1<sup>st</sup>.

The Texas Property Tax Code, under Section 25.18, requires each appraisal office to implement a plan to update appraised values for real property at least once every three years. The district's policy is to conduct a general reappraisal of taxable property every year. Appraised values are reviewed annually and are subject to change. All properties are appraised every year. Tax year 2025 and tax year 2026 are reappraisal years.

The appraised value of real estate is calculated using specific information about each property. Using computer-assisted mass appraisal programs and recognized appraisal methods and techniques, the appraisal district compares that information with the data for similar properties and with recent cost and market data. The district follows the standards of the International Association of Assessing Officers (IAAO) regarding its appraisal practices and procedures, and subscribes to the standards promulgated by the Appraisal Foundation, known as the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) to the extent they are applicable.

## PERSONNEL RESOURCES

The office of the Chief Appraiser is primarily responsible for overall planning, organizing, staffing, coordinating, and controlling of the appraisal district operations.

The district's appraisers are subject to the provisions of the Property Taxation Professional Certification Act and must be duly registered with the Texas Department of Licensing and Regulations.

The appraisal district staff consists of 2 employees with the following classifications:

- \* Kayla Box Chief Appraiser, RPA, RTA
- \* Sandra Skinner

All personnel that are performing appraisal work are registered with the Texas Department of Licensing and Regulation and are required to take appraisal courses to achieve the status of Registered Professional Appraiser within five years of employment as an appraiser. After they are awarded their license, they must receive additional training as required to maintain certification. Failure to meet these minimum standards results in termination of employment.

Additionally, the chief appraiser ensures that personnel receives on-the-job training to ensure quality and uniformity of appraisals of all types of property and monitors appraisal activity to ensure that standardized appraisal procedures are being followed by all personnel.

## REVALUATION DECISION (REAPPRAISAL CYCLE):

The Cottle CAD, by policy adopted by the Board of Directors and the Chief Appraiser, reappraises all property in the district every year. The reappraisal may consist of field inspections, CAMA, or both. The reappraisal year is a complete appraisal of all properties in the district. Tax year 2025 is a reappraisal year and tax year 2026 is a reappraisal year. Each year, Notices of Appraised Value are mailed to property owners in the District reflecting changes that have occurred.

Additionally, every tax year the District inspects and appraises new construction and adds those properties to the appraisal roll. The district also inspects and reappraises properties that have been remodeled or demolished, properties with additions, properties with fire damage, or properties with any change or damage. These changes are found through building permits issued by the city when available. However, since building permits are not required for properties outside the city limits and are not often acquired within the city limits, District staff maintains a file of newspaper clippings that pertain to changes in property and all District staff remains alert to visual changes in properties. Throughout the year, notes are made on those visual changes and all information is provided to the field appraiser. The field appraiser will also conduct detailed field inspections of properties if requested by the owner and reappraise these properties as necessary. Notices of Appraised Value are mailed to all property owners each year.

Eagle Appraisal and Consulting compiles all valid sales by school district. Problematic areas are further researched and may indicate the use of market modifiers. The use of these modifiers is the predominant method of adjusting sales for location and time. Values throughout the county may be adjusted by use of market modifiers during the reappraisal year.

#### **PERFORMANCE ANALYSIS:**

Performance Analysis – the equalized values from the previous tax year—are analyzed with ratio studies to determine the appraisal accuracy and appraisal uniformity overall and by market area within property reporting categories. Ratio studies are conducted in compliance with the current *Standard on Ratio Studies* of the International Association of Assessing Officers. Mean, median, and weighted ratios are calculated for properties in reporting categories to measure the level of appraisal accuracy. The mean ratio is calculated in each reappraised category to indicate the level of appraisal accuracy by property reporting category. In 2025, the reappraisal year, this analysis is used to develop the starting point for establishing the level and accuracy of appraisal performance. In 2026, the reappraisal year, this analysis is used to develop the starting point for establishing the level and accuracy of appraisal performance. In 2025 and 2026, any reporting category that may have been excluded from reappraisal due to lack of data to support reappraisal will be tested and analyzed to arrive at an indication of uniformity or equity of existing appraisals.

Sales ratio studies are used to evaluate the District's mass appraisal performance. These studies not only provide a measure of performance, but also are an excellent means of improving mass appraisal performance. The District uses ratio studies not only to aid in the reappraisal of properties, but also to test the State Comptroller's Property Tax Division Annual Property Value Study results.

Eagle Appraisal and Consulting usually begins ratio studies in late January or early February, with all sales reports being compiled by school district. Within the boundaries of the districts, the ratios are analyzed to identify comparable neighborhoods. Outliers and questions that were not identified in the field are reviewed and analyzed. Field cards indicating the results of field inspections of the sold properties are available for each individual sale to further aid in making decisions regarding outliers.

Outliers are characterized as having low or high ratios. They can result from an erroneous or unrepresentative sale price, an error in the appraisal, or a mismatch between the property sold and the property appraised.

Remaining sales are then correlated to indicate comparable neighborhoods within each school district. The sales from each comparable neighborhood are grouped (stratified) according to classification. The median ratio indicated by the sales is then compared to the desired ratio. The coefficient of dispersion is also studied to indicate how tight the ratios are in relation to the measures of central tendency. The median and coefficient of dispersion are good indicators of the types of changes to be made if any are necessary. The use of market modifiers is the predominant method of adjusting sales for location and time to indicate market values. Market modifiers are methods of adjusting property to equal the market without changing the schedules.

#### **ANALYSIS OF AVAILABLE RESOURCES:**

Staffing and budget requirements for tax year 2025 are detailed in the 2025 budget, as adopted by the Board of Directors of the Cottle County Appraisal District, and attached to the written biennial plan by reference. This reappraisal plan is adjusted to reflect the available staffing in tax year 2025 and anticipated staffing for tax year 2025 or tax year 2026. Budget restraints can impact the cycle of real property re-inspection and personal property on-site review that can be accomplished in the 2025-2026 time period.

Existing appraisal practices, which are continued from year to year, are identified and methods utilized to keep these practices current. In the reappraisal year, real property appraisal depreciation tables are tested against verified sales data to ensure they represent current market data. Personal property density schedules are tested and analyzed based on renditions and prior year documentation. Due to lack of sales of personal property in the district, the Comptroller's Guide may be utilized to appraise personal property and for testing and analysis purposes.

Information Systems (IS) support is detailed and system upgrades are scheduled. Existing maps and data requirements are continually updated and kept current.

The Texas Legislature amended the appraisal review board appeal process by allowing arbitration in addition to filing suit in District Court with certain limitations. It is anticipated that the number of arbitration requests will increase as the public becomes more informed of this option. Time and effort expended on arbitration cases is a good indicator that additional recourses as well as an increase in staffing may become necessary as the arbitration process evolves.

All appraisal companies may face arbitration or lawsuits in any appraisal year.

Existing appraisal practices, which are continued from year to year, are identified and methods utilized to keep these practices current are specified. Current cost schedules for residential and commercial real properties are derived and updated from Marshall and Swift Valuation Service. Marshall and Swift Valuation Service is a national based cost manual and is generally accepted throughout the nation by the real estate appraisal industry. In a reappraisal year, real property appraisal depreciation tables and cost new tables are tested against verified sales data to ensure they represent current market data. Personal property density schedules are tested and analyzed based on rendition and prior year protest hearing documentation.

Changes in legislation involving appraisal districts may occur in 2025 when the legislature is called into session. These new laws may require adjustments to the budget, staffing, and programming.

### **PLANNING AND ORGANIZATION:**

A calendar of key events with critical completion dates is prepared for each area of work. This calendar identifies key events for appraisal, clerical, customer service, and information systems. A calendar is prepared for tax years 2025 and 2026. Production standards for field activities are calculated and incorporated in the planning and scheduling process.

Eagle Appraisal & Consulting will begin the field inspections of Area One in September of 2024 and will complete all inspections and schedules by April 1, 2025 for the 2025 tax year.

Eagle Appraisal & Consulting will begin the field inspections of Area Two in September of 2025 and will complete all inspections and schedules by April 1, 2026 for the 2026 tax year.

## **MASS APPRAISAL SYSTEM:**

Computer Assisted Mass Appraisal (CAMA) system revisions are completed by the Information Systems Software Provider. System revisions and procedures are performed by the Provider. Cottle County Appraisal District contracted with the firm of Pritchard & Abbott, Inc. for these services.

Appraisal information for each area of work, maps for each area of work, and appraisal cards showing sketches and pictures of the properties included in the area of work will be provided by the District to the field appraisers.

The District anticipates devoting some programming time to allow for the development of new reports to help manage and edit the information provided by the field appraisers.

#### **Real Property Valuation**

Revisions to cost models, income models, and market models are specified, updated, and tested each tax year.

Cost schedules are tested with market data (sales) to insure that the appraisal district is in compliance with Texas Property Tax Code, Section 23.011. Replacement cost new tables as well as depreciation tables are tested for accuracy and uniformity using ratio study tools and compared with cost data from recognized industry leaders, such as Marshall & Swift.

Land schedules are updated using current market data (sales) and then tested with ratio study tools. Value schedules are developed and tested on a pilot basis with ratio study tools.

#### **Personal Property Valuation**

Density schedules are tested using data received during the previous tax year from renditions and hearing documentation. Valuation procedures are reviewed, modified as needed, and tested. The latest edition of the Comptroller's Guide is utilized heavily in the appraisal of personal property in the district.

#### **Noticing Process**

25.19 appraisal notice forms are provided by the IS Provider. The Provider reviews and edits for updates and changes required by legislative mandates.

The district publishes, in the local newspaper, information about the notices and how to protest. The district makes available the latest copy of the Comptroller's pamphlet Taxpayer's Rights, Remedies, and Responsibilities.

#### **Hearing Process**

Protest hearing scheduling for informal and formal Appraisal Review Board hearings is reviewed and updated as required. Standards of documentation are reviewed and amended as required. The appraisal district hearing documentation is reviewed and updated to reflect the current valuation process and requirements. Compliance with House Bill 201 is insured.

District staff or Eagle Appraisal & Consulting representatives conducts the initial informal hearing with a protesting property owner. If the protest cannot be settled within the guidelines set out for District staff, an informal hearing appointment is set for a meeting between the protesting property owner and staff members of Eagle Appraisal and Consulting. If valuation issues are not agreed upon at this level, the protesting property owner may elect to proceed to a formal hearing.

Evidence in compliance with HB 201 may be requested by the property owner or the property owner's agent and will be made available at least 14 days prior to the scheduled protest hearing.

#### **DATA COLLECTION REQUIREMENTS:**

Cottle County Appraisal District cost and value schedules include land, residential improved, commercial improved, and personal property. Data sources currently used by the District include cost information from Marshall and Swift Valuation Service, cost data obtained from local contractors, and renditions provided by the property owners. Marshall and Swift Valuation Service is a national based cost manual and is generally accepted throughout the nation by the real estate appraisal industry. This cost manual is based on cost per unit or square foot and also uses the unit in place method. The unit in place method involves the estimated cost by using actual building components. This national based cost information service provides the base price of buildings by classification with modifications for equipment and additional items. The District's schedule is then modified for time and location.

Field and office procedures are reviewed and revised as required for data collection. Activities for each tax year include new construction, demolition, remodeling, reinspection of problematic market areas, re-inspection of the universe of properties on a specific cycle, and field or office verification of sales data and property characteristics. On properties that have transferred ownership, the District will verify the sales price and individual property characteristics as of the date of the sale through field inspection and office research.

Renditions are confidential sources and cannot be used for specific information. However, data from renditions may be compared with data obtained from cost manuals and used to test schedules for accuracy.

Data on individual properties is also collected from the field, compiled, and analyzed. Buildings and other improvements are inspected in the field, measured, and classified. The appraiser estimates the age and condition of the improvements. This data is used to compile depreciation tables. Any notes pertaining to the improvements are made during inspection.

#### **Land Analysis**

Residential land valuation analysis is conducted prior to neighborhood sales analysis. The value of the land component to the property is estimated based on available market sales for comparable and competing land under similar usage. A comparison and analysis of comparable land sales is conducted based on a comparison of land characteristics found to influence the market price in the neighborhood. Computerized land tables store the information required to consistently value individual parcels within neighborhoods given known land characteristics. Specific land influences are considered, where necessary, and depending on neighborhood and individual lot or tract characteristics, to adjust parcels outside the neighborhood norm for such factors as access, view, shape, size, and topography. The appraisers use abstraction and allocation methods to insure that estimated land values best reflect the contributory market value of the land to the overall property value.

#### **Area Analysis**

Data on regional economic forces such as demographic patterns, regional locational factors, employment and income patterns, general trends in real property prices and rents, interest rate trends, availability of vacant land, and construction trends and costs are collected from private vendors and public sources and provide the field appraiser a current economic outlook on the real estate market. Information is gleaned from real estate publications and sources such as continuing education in the form of IAAO classes and other approved classes.

#### Neighborhood and Market Analysis

Neighborhood analysis involves the examination of how physical, economic, governmental and social forces and other influences affect property values. The effects of these forces are also used to identify, classify, and stratify comparable properties into smaller, manageable subsets of the universe of properties known as neighborhoods. Residential valuation and neighborhood analysis is conducted on various market areas within the district. Analysis of comparable market sales forms the basis of estimating market activity and the level of supply and demand affecting market prices for any given market area.

#### **Highest and Best Use Analysis**

The highest and best use of property is the reasonable and probable use that supports the highest present value as of the date of the appraisal. The highest and best use must be physically possible, legal, financially feasible, and productive to its maximum. The highest and best use of residential property is normally its current use. This is due, in part, to the fact that residential development, in many areas, through use of deed restrictions and zoning, precludes other land uses. Residential valuation undertakes reassessment of highest and best use in transition areas and areas of mixed residential and commercial use. In transition areas with ongoing gentrification, the appraiser reviews the existing residential property use and makes a determination regarding highest and best use. Once the conclusion is made that the highest and best use remains residential, further highest and best use analysis is done to decide the type of residential use on a neighborhood basis. In areas of mixed residential and commercial use, the appraiser reviews properties in these areas on a periodic basis to determine if changes in the real estate market require reassessment of the highest and best use of a select population of properties.

#### **New Construction/Demolition**

The appraisers performing reappraisals in the field have field cards that contain specific information regarding the property being appraised. These cards contain brief legal descriptions, ownership interests, property use codes, property addresses, land size, and sketches of improvements as well as detailed information of any improvements.

Appraisal field inspections require the appraisers to check all information on the field cards and to update the information when necessary.

New construction field and office review procedures are identified and revised as required. Sources of building permits are confirmed. The City of Paducah provides a listing of permits issued during the previous year. However, not all new construction acquires a permit so the District relies heavily upon visual sightings by District staff. Additionally, the local newspaper's articles are kept throughout the year for reference purposes.

Local contractors and builders are another source of cost data utilized by the District. Local contractors provide cost data on new structures that is compared to cost information obtained from Marshall Swift Valuation.

#### Remodeling

Properties with extensive improvement remodeling are identified and field inspections are scheduled to update property characteristic data. Permits issued by the city and visual sightings by District staff are key components in this area. Copies of permits are provided by the District to the field appraiser. Notes made throughout the year as remodeling projects are observed are provided by the District to the field appraiser.

#### Re-inspection of Problematic Market Areas

Real property market areas, by property classification, are tested for low or high ratio sales and/or high coefficients of dispersion. Market areas that fail any or all of these tests are determined to be problematic. Field inspections are scheduled to verify and/or correct property characteristic data. Additional sales data is researched and verified.

#### **Re-inspection of the Universe of Properties**

The International Association of Assessing Officers' Standard on Mass Appraisal of Real Property, specifies that the universe of properties should be re-inspected on a cycle of 3 years. The re-inspection includes physically viewing the property, photographing, and verifying the accuracy of the existing data. The field appraiser has an appraisal card of each property to be inspected and makes notes of changes, depreciation changes, remodeling, additions, etc. The annual re-inspection requirements for tax years 2025 and 2026 are identified and scheduled in the written reappraisal plan.

#### Field or Office Verification of Sales Data and Property Characteristics

Sales information is received from various sources. These sources include conversations with local real estate appraisers, agents, and brokers. Also, from deed transactions, the District mails out sales surveys to sellers and purchasers in an effort to obtain additional sales information that may not be otherwise discovered.

These sales are compared to the existing data on the field cards and changes are made as indicated. These changes include age and condition as well as any improvements made to the property before the sale takes place. When sales information indicates a difference in the improvement's square footage, the buildings are remeasured.

Sales information must be verified and property characteristic data contemporaneous with the date of sale captured. The sales ratio tools require that the property that sold must equal the property appraised in order that statistical analysis results will be valid.

#### PILOT STUDY BY TAX YEAR:

New and/or revised mass appraisal models are tested each tax year. Ratio studies, by market area, are conducted on proposed values each tax year. Proposed values on each category are tested for accuracy and reliability. Actual test results are compared with anticipated results and those models not performing satisfactorily are refined and retested. The procedures used for model specification and calibration are in compliance with USPAP, STANDARD RULE 6.

Residential valuation schedules are cost-based tables modified by actual sales with the cost reflecting the actual replacement cost new of the subject property, market research indicates that the common unit of comparison for new residential construction as well as

sales of existing housing is the price paid per square foot. The value of extra items is based on their contributory value to the property. This value may be estimated by the price per square foot or a value of the item as a whole. This data is extracted from the market by paired sales analysis and conversations with local appraisers and brokers. These schedules are formulated from the Marshall and Swift Valuation Service Residential Handbook.

The residential schedule is based on quality of construction, size of structure, condition of structure, contributory value of extra items, and land value. Each of these variables has a direct impact on the cost as well as the value of a property. Following is an example of each of the variables and how they may affect market value.

- 1. Quality of construction: Residential construction may vary greatly in quality of construction. The type of construction affects the quality and cost of the material used, the quality of the workmanship, as well as the attention paid to detail. The cost and value of residential property will vary greatly, depending on the quality of construction. The District's Appraisal Manual contains an expanded description of classifications used and is attached by reference.
- 2. Size of structure: The size of a building also has a direct impact on its cost as well as its value. The larger the building, the less the cost per square foot. The District's schedules are graduated in size increments, depending on market conditions. Marshall and Swift Valuation Service also supports this size factor. The District's Appraisal Manual contains an expanded description of size increments and square footage breakdown's and is attached by reference.
- 3. Condition of improvements: The District rates conditions as very poor, poor, fair, average, good, very good, and excellent. Upon physical inspection appraisers, using their own judgment of age and condition of the structure, applies a depreciation factor. This factor is based generally on one (1) percent for each two years of age. Properties that, in the opinion of the appraisers, are unlivable are not appraised according to the schedule. Rather, they are appraised at salvage value or are marked as no value at all.
- 4. Age of Structure: The District's field appraiser assigns an approximate effective age. This method is supported by conversations with local appraisers and builders who estimate the economic life of residential properties to be approximately 50 years. Properties in the age 51 and over bracket are given the maximum amount of depreciation unless remodeling or very good upkeep has allowed the structure to maintain a longer life. The effective age and chronological age may or may not be the same depending on the condition of the structure. This depreciation factor is generally based on one (1) percent for each two years of age.
- 5. Extra items: Extra items are valued according to their contributory value to the whole. Examples of extra items include covered porches, patios, screened or enclosed porches, storage buildings, swimming pools, etc. The District's Appraisal Manual contains more specific information regarding extra items and is attached by reference.
- 6. Land Value: The District values land based on market transactions. Units of comparison depend on how the property is purchased and marketed. Large acreage tracts are usually purchased based on the price per acre. Commercial tracts are purchased based on the price per square foot, and residential properties are purchased based on price per front

foot. Depth factors are used to modify values according to market indicators. Land prices vary throughout the District, therefore, their values are dependent upon homogenous areas. Land schedules for residential, commercial, agricultural, and industrial properties are available upon request from the District.

Inspections of property are made by exterior perspective, so the interior finish as well as interior components are assumed and are not adjusted. All financing for comparable sales is considered typical to the market. The final estimate of value is a correlation of the comparable sales after net adjustments have been deducted from the sales price to equal the subject property. The value by this method is estimated by the appraiser and is not a function of the computer.

#### **VALUATION BY TAX YEAR:**

Using market analysis of comparable sales and locally tested cost data, market area specific income and expense data, valuation models (Cost Per Square Foot Schedules) are specified and calibrated in compliance with supplemental standards from the International Association of Assessing Officers and the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice. The calculated values are tested for accuracy and uniformity using ratio studies. Performance standards are those as established by the IAAO Standard on Ratio Studies. Property values in all market areas are updated each reappraisal year. Properties in selected market areas are updated in non-reappraisal years. Tax year 2025 is a reappraisal year. Tax year 2026 is a reappraisal year. Note: The district will describe its valuation methods by property types.

#### RESIDENTIAL REAL PROPERTY

Sales Comparison Approach to Value Cost Approach to Value Income Approach to Value

#### SPECIAL INVENTORY RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY

Sales Comparison Approach to Value Cost Approach to Value Income Approach to Value

#### **MULTIFAMILY RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY**

Sales Comparison Approach to Value Cost Approach to Value Income Approach to Value

#### **COMMERCIAL REAL PROPERTY**

Sales Comparison Approach to Value

Cost Approach to Value Income Approach to Value

#### VACANT REAL PROPERTY

Sales Comparison Approach to Value Cost Approach to Value Income Approach to Value

#### INDUSTRIAL REAL PROPERTY

Sales Comparison Approach to Value Cost Approach to Value Income Approach to Value

#### **UTILITIES**

Sales Comparison Approach to Value Cost Approach to Value Income Approach to Value

## MINERAL INTEREST

Sales Comparison Approach to Value Cost Approach to Value Income Approach to Value

#### **SPECIAL VALUATION PROPERTIES**

Agricultural Use Wildlife Management Timber Use

#### **BUSINESS TANGIBLE PERSONAL PROPERTY**

Sales Comparison Approach to Value Cost Approach to Value Income Approach to Value

#### INDUSTRIAL TANGIBLE PERSONAL PROPERTY

Sales Comparison Approach to Value Cost Approach to Value Income Approach to Value

## Sales Comparison Approach to Value

The sales comparison approach to value is utilized by grouping or clustering sales within the specified neighborhoods and classification of properties. The sales are then tested against appraised values to indicate a ratio for the neighborhood. A neighborhood is a grouping of complementary land uses affected equally by the four forces that influence property value: social trends, economic circumstances, governmental contracts and

regulations, and environmental conditions. These factors have an impact on the value of properties within this grouping and in turn on properties being appraised.

Individual neighborhood boundaries within the District vary according to market indications and the type of property being appraised. The boundaries of these neighborhoods may be physical, geographical, or political in nature. Generally, residential neighborhoods consist of individual subdivisions or clusters of subdivisions that contain similar properties located within the same school district. Commercial neighborhoods may be smaller areas within a city, an entire city, or rural area. Industrial neighborhoods may include the entire District. Defining neighborhood boundaries depends on the subject of the appraisal assignment.

If sufficient sales are not found, then sales from competing neighborhoods are found and appropriate adjustments are made in the form of market modifiers. These modifiers are applied to cost schedules to indicate mass appraisal values for a given neighborhood. Therefore, the sales comparison approach is actually blended with the cost approach to create a hybrid of these two approaches to value.

#### **Cost Approach to Value:**

The District uses a hybrid cost model developed from Marshall and Swift Valuation Service. The cost model categorizes and values property by class, age, condition, and extra items. Depreciation is derived by age/condition and any additional depreciation that may be necessary. Land value is added to indicate a preliminary market value for like properties within the subject neighborhoods. After cost schedules, depreciation, and land values are applied, then a market modifier may be necessary to adjust the values to actual market conditions. These modifiers apply to improvements only and do not adjust land values. Therefore, the cost approach to value is actually a hybrid of the sales comparison and cost approaches to value.

#### **Income Approach to Value:**

The income approach to value or rent multipliers are currently not a reliable indicator of value for residential mass appraisal reports unless rents are specified. Databases or data sources for income producing residential properties are not available in the Cottle County area. Therefore, the income approach to value is not used in the **residential** mass appraisal report but is used for other types of properties.

Additional information concerning approaches to value for specific types of properties, such as minerals, utilities, industrial, railroads, pipelines, industrial personal property, etc. may be found in the Plan provided by Pritchard & Abbott, Inc., the Appraisal Company that performs those appraisals, and is attached to this plan by reference.

#### **Special Valuation Process:**

Agricultural Use: Market value for agricultural property is established by acceptable appraisal methodology.

The District also values agricultural property by the income approach as set forth in the Texas Property Tax code. This is a special valuation process as there are parameters set forth in the Code regarding capitalization rates. Income and expenses for each different category of agricultural use is estimated from surveys, actual rental data obtained by property owners as well as conversations with local governmental agencies. The formula used is set out by the Texas Property Tax Code and is as follows: net-to-land (all ag related income streams – all ag related expenses) / cap rate = ag value.

#### THE MASS APPRAISAL REPORT:

Each tax year, the required Mass Appraisal Report is prepared and certified by the Chief Appraiser at the conclusion of the appraisal phase of the ad valorem tax calendar (on or about May 15<sup>th</sup>). The Mass Appraisal Report is completed in compliance with STANDARD RULE 6 – 8 of the *Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice*. The signed certification by the Chief Appraiser is compliant with STANDARD RULE 6 – 9 of *USPAP*. This written reappraisal plan is attached to the report by reference.

#### **VALUE DEFENSE:**

Evidence to be used by the appraisal district to meet its burden of proof for market value and equity in both informal and formal appraisal review board hearings is specified and tested. Note: The appraisal district identifies the evidence to be used in informal and formal hearings by property type and the steps to be taken to insure compliance with House Bill 201.

RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY
SPECIAL INVENTORY RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY
MULTIFAMILY RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY
COMMERCIAL REAL PROPERTY
VACANT REAL PROPERTY
INDUSTRIAL REAL PROPERTY
UTILITIES
MINERAL INTEREST
SPECIAL VALUATION PROPERTIES
BUSINESS TANGIBLE PERSONAL PROPERTY
INDUSTRIAL TANGIBLE PERSONAL PROPERTY

Informal hearings are conducted by phone, mail, or in person by District appraisers. Appraisers may present sales data or data specific to the property in defense of the District values. If the taxpayer wishes to pursue a dispute further, the appraiser or District staff will guide them through the initial phase of the formal protest procedures.

When taxpayers are scheduled for formal hearings, they receive an ARB procedures pamphlet and a copy of the *Taxpayer's Rights, Remedies, and Responsibilities* published by the State Comptroller's office. If protest hearing evidence is requested, the appraisal district has 14 days prior to the protest hearing to make its evidence regarding value disputes available. Information provided, as appropriate, may include but is not limited to: comparable sales and applicable schedules, depreciation tables, a copy of the discount cash flow model developed to calculate the current inventory value, income and expense information derived from the market that has been accumulated and developed into charts containing general data, applicable appraisal reports and research data applicable to the property, etc. At no time, except as provided by the Texas Property Code, will any confidential income, expense, sales, or other information received from taxpayers on specific accounts be released.

#### **COMPUTER ASSISTED MASS APPRAISAL SYSTEM**

Eagle Appraisal and Consulting field appraisers will submit appraisal cards reflecting changes and notes made during the field inspection to appraisal district staff for data entry. Pictures will also be taken by the field appraiser and submitted on a timely basis for downloading by appraisal district staff.

Appraisal district staff will be responsible for entering all name and address changes received by phone, letter, or from the front counter. Staff will also be responsible for entering any exemption changes, as well as any supplemental changes. Staff is responsible for backing up computer files and maintaining changes to the maps.

The software providers are responsible for providing training and assisting appraisal district staff concerning use of existing and new programs.

#### **ARB APPEAL PROCEDURES:**

After the Appraisal Review Board hears and determines all timely filed protests, the District mails, by certified mail with return receipt, the ARB orders containing the Board's decision on the protest to the property owners. Property owners have 60 days after receiving a Board Order to either file suit in District Court or to file a request for arbitration. Information on procedures for appealing an ARB order is included in the order along with a Request for Binding Arbitration form.

This page intentionally left blank.

## PLANNING A REAPPRAISAL

Variation in reappraisal requirements requires Cottle County Appraisal District to carefully plan its work before beginning any reappraisal. Although the planning process may vary in specifics, it should involve five (5) basic steps:

- 1. Assess current performance.
- 2. Set reappraisal goals.
- 3. Assess available resources and determine needs.
- 4. Re-evaluate goals and adjust as necessary.
- 5. Develop a work plan.

## STEPS IN A REAPPRAISAL

The International Association of Assessing Officers (IAAO) textbook, <u>Property Appraisal</u> and <u>Assessment Administration</u>, lists ten steps in a reappraisal. These steps outline those activities performed by Cottle County Appraisal District for the completion of periodic reappraisals. Activities are listed below in the order in which they occur:

- 1. Performance Analysis:
  - A. ratio study
  - B. equity of existing values
  - C. consistency of values with market activity
- 2. Revaluation Decision:
  - A. statutory at least once every three years
  - B. administrative policy
- 3. Analysis of Available Resources:
  - A. staffing
  - B. budget
  - C. existing practices
  - D. information system support
  - E. existing data and maps
- 4. Planning and Organization
  - A. target completion dates
  - B. identify performance objectives
  - C. specific action plans and schedules
  - D. identify critical activities with completion dates
  - E. set production standards for field activities
- 5. Mass Appraisal System:
  - A. forms and procedures revised as necessary
  - B. CAMA (computer assisted mass appraisal) system revisions as required
- 6. Conduct Pilot Study
  - A. test new/revised appraisal methods as applicable
  - B. conduct ratio studies

- C. determine if values are accurate and reliable
- 7. Data Collection
  - A. building permits and other sources of new construction
  - B. check properties that have undergone remodeling
  - C. reinspection of problematic properties
  - D. reinspection of universe of properties on a cyclic basis
- **8.** Valuation:
  - A. market analysis (based on ratio studies)
  - B. schedules development
  - C. application of revised schedules
  - D. calculation of preliminary values
  - E. tests of values for accuracy and uniformity
- 9. The Mass Appraisal Report
  - A. establish scope of work
  - B. compliance with Standards Rule 6 7 of USPAP
  - C. signed certification by the chief appraiser as required by Standards Rule 6-8 of USPAP
- 10. Value Defense:
  - A. prepare and deliver notices of value to property owners
  - B. hold informal hearings
  - C. schedule and hold formal appeal hearings
    - \*\*Note—the burden of proof (evidence) of market values and equity falls on the appraisal district.\*\*

# Cottle County Appraisal District Residential, Commercial, Rural, and Personal Property 2025/2026 Reappraisal Plan

This plan for reappraisal was written by Cottle County Appraisal District in conjunction with Eagle Appraisal and Consulting and utilizes the Eagle Appraisal and Consulting methodology and is in compliance with USPAP requirements.

Pursuant to Section 25.18 of the Texas Property Tax Code, the Cottle County Appraisal District has established the following physical inspection plan to provide for the inspection of all property within the district at least once every three (3) years. The plan establishes a two-fold approach:

- 1. Two-Year Cycle: The CAD is divided into two areas. Each year, all real residential and commercial property within one of the areas will be reappraised or physically inspected, data updated and photographed, regardless of any ratio study/report findings. These areas are identified as follows:
  - a. Area One: All property located inside the city limits of the City of Paducah. The reappraisal year for this area is 2025.
  - b. Area Two: All property located outside the city limits of the City of Paducah within the boundaries of Cottle County. The reappraisal year for this area is 2026.
    - \*\*Note: all income producing personal property within the CAD is appraised on an annual basis, regardless of its location.\*\*
- 2. Annual Ratio Reports: In addition to the two year cycle stated above, ratio studies shall be performed annually to determine areas or categories of properties within the CAD which need to be reappraised within the current year based on sales ratios. Any areas or categories whose ratios are above or below statutory requirements shall be reappraised in the current year regardless of the area in which they are located.
- 3. Market Areas Defined: Market areas in Area 1 are defined as all property inside the city limits of the City of Paducah. Market areas in Area 2 are defined as all property located in Paducah ISD, Childress ISD and Quanah ISD within the boundaries of Cottle County and excluding properties located inside the city limits of the City of Paducah.

This two-fold approach will insure not only that all residential and commercial property within the CAD is reappraised at least once every three years, but also that all other categories within the CAD are reviewed annually so that the appraisal district stays current with respect to market value in those areas where residential and/or commercial property values appear to be changing rapidly.

#### **Organization**

Field inspections are carried out by the field appraiser as directed by the chief appraiser. The field appraiser physically inspects areas required by the reappraisal cycle, checks all existing data, works building permits, takes photographs of improvements, draws plans of new improvements for entry into computer, rechecks any property on which a question or problem has arisen. Other duties may be required and will be executed upon direction of the chief appraiser.

Data entry of field work notes and sketches is performed by appraisal district staff.

The chief appraiser performs market analysis. Sales data is gathered throughout the year from deed records, sales confirmation letters from property owners, and other sources. The market data is analyzed, sales data is confirmed, outliers are identified, existing classification system is reviewed, market schedules are reviewed and updated as necessary, and final market schedules are applied to the universe of properties.

#### 2025 Reappraisal Schedule

#### September, 2024:

Begin on-site inspections

#### Mid December, 2024:

- 1. Begin planning sales ratio studies for all areas within the CAD.
- 2. Gather current sales data from sales confirmation letters deed records, and other sources.

#### January to March, 2025:

- 1. Mail homestead applications, special-use valuation applications, personal property renditions, exemption applications, and any other required forms.
- 2. Complete field inspections as provided by the reappraisal plan area.
- 3. Begin running sales ratio reports. Compare with CAD values and sales information.
- 4. Continue working with the Comptroller's Office regarding the ratio study.
- 5. Identify necessary schedule adjustments.
- 6. Begin update of the USPAP report (Mass Appraisal Report).
- 7. Begin working renditions.

## March through April, 2025:

- 1. Continue running sales ratio reports.
- 2. Refine sales analysis and mass appraisal schedules.
- 3. Statistically test schedules.
- 4. Complete data entry of all reappraisal and maintenance changes.
- 5. Assist field appraiser with reappraisal functions as needed.
- 6. Finalize all field work and data collection activities.
- 7. Execute mass appraisal/maintenance activities as required.
- 8. Prepare for mailing 2025 Notices of Value.
- 9. Mail appropriate letters concerning homesteads, special-use appraisals, etc.
- 10. Continue working renditions.

## May through June, 2025:

- 1. Mail notices of value.
- 2. Hold informal hearings.
- 3. Respond to property owners' inquiries, protests, and questions from notice mailings.
- 4. Mail notices of ARB hearing appointment letter.
- 5. Mail protest hearing reminder letters.
- 6. Provide certified estimated values to taxing units.
- 7. Hold ARB hearings.
- 8. Mail ARB certified change/no change orders.
- 9. Mail appropriate ARB pending decision letters.
- 10. Mail appropriate penalty letters on non-rendered personal property.

#### July, 2025:

- 1. Complete the process of mailing certified ARB orders.
- 2. Enter into computer all changes as ordered by ARB and notify other CADs if the ordered change falls into an over-lapping area.
- 3. ARB approval of appraisal records by July 20th.
- 4. Certification of appraisal records and values to taxing units by July 25<sup>th</sup>.

#### As needed throughout the year 2025:

1. Handle any outstanding protests by scheduling ARB hearings.

Additionally, work outside of the appraisal process must be completed on a timely basis. Cottle County Appraisal District is a small district with limited staff, therefore departments are not designated. District staff must complete, in a timely manner, the work assigned by the chief appraiser. The work schedule, in addition to the above scheduled calendar, is as follows:

#### Daily:

- 1. Back up daily data entries.
- 2. Tax master maintenance (name, address, legal, value, etc.) data entry.
- 3. Drawing maintenance data entry.
- 4. Maintain prorated accounts.
- 5. Maintain exempt frozen accounts.
- 6. Mobile home changes data entry.
- 7. Residential, commercial, personal property, industrial, mineral changes data entry.
- 8. Agricultural changes data entry.
- 9. Send appraisal roll changes/tax roll changes to appropriate taxing units, if the changes affect the current tax roll.
- 10. Download pictures provided by the field appraiser.

#### Weekly:

- 1. System backup.
- 2. PC servers backup.

#### As Needed:

- 1. Make changes for supplemental accounts and update tax master.
- 2. Update previous years' tax masters.
- 3. Programming changes.
- 4. Create new reports.
- 5. Mail letters on properties receiving over-65 exemption where the property owner is now deceased.
- 6. Homestead letters.
- 7. Notices of change.
- 8. Maintain records retention (scan, store, etc.)
- 9. Mail new special-use (agricultural) applications due to change of ownership.
- 10. Continue to obtain deed changes and key in ownership changes and parcel boundary changes and create new accounts as needed.
- 11. Continue to provide assistance to property owners and the general public by answering phone calls and assisting with walk-in customers, real estate agents, landsmen, etc.
- 12. Process and sell digital parcel data as requested.
- 13. Update and maintain maps.

While the scope of work is not limited to the scheduled tasks, the District has endeavored to identify the **main** yearly tasks. To further pinpoint scheduled tasks, the following calendar has been implemented for District staff, but the work is not limited to the tasks contained in this calendar:

## January, 2025 and 2025:

- 1. All personal property renditions are mailed.
- 2. Obtain building permits issued by city and code the appropriate parcel for inspection by a field appraiser.
- 3. Continue with data entry of completed field work cards.
- 4. Prepare and key in data on all splits and combines.
- 5. Prepare monthly reports.
- 6. Maintain records management program.
- 7. Mail various applications.
- 8. Notify the tax assessor/collector of each taxing unit of any changes which require a refund.
- 9. Hold an ARB meeting to receive the supplemental records, complete the Statement of Officer form, administer Oaths of Office, etc.
- 10. Prepare and have available for inspection by the BOD and the ARB the 25.25b change reports.
- 11. Publish the quarter-page ad on availability of exemptions, rendition requirements, special appraisals, and tax deferrals.
- 12. Publicize the uniform procedure to appraise inventory.
- 13. Approve or ratify contracts with vendors.
- 14. Enter data on new abatements.
- 15. Schedule BOD meeting and include executive session if necessary.
- 16. Notify appropriate tax units and other persons of any completed abatements and provide preliminary estimates of value in order for them to determine abatement percentages.
- 17. Obtain "cap rate" to be used in 2025 appraisals (or 2026 appraisals, as appropriate).
- 18. Submit updated current year appraisal roll to each tax unit.
- 19. Continue data entry of name/address changes, splits and combines, subdivision information, and personal property into the current file.
- 20. Complete "end-of-year clean-up" in the computer and set the computer to accept current year information.
- 21. Train District staff on the use of any changes to computer programs.
- 22. Develop new reports as needed.
- 23. Maintain website.
- 24. Send sales information and deed transfer information to State Comptroller's Office by February 1.
- 25. Work with Eagle Appraisal and Consulting to determine possible dates for Ag Advisory Council meetings and set those meetings up.

#### February, 2025 and 2026:

- 1. Continue keying in recheck notes.
- 2. Continue downloading pictures provided by field appraiser.
- 3. Proof changes keyed in.
- 4. Continue data entry of sketches/drawings.
- 5. Set up new business accounts.

- 6. Research returned mail.
- 7. Maintain records management program.
- 8. Prepare all changes for the ARB meeting.
- 9. Start ordering process for appraisal notices and other forms.
- 10. Prepare for possible appeal of Comptroller's ratio study. Begin accumulating sales information to prepare appeal.
- 11. Notify tax assessors/collectors of any changes which require refunds.
- 12. Maintain website and update it with any new forms, schedules, deadlines, etc.
- 13. Require the BOD, ARB, and chief appraiser to sign affidavits regarding delinquent taxes.
- 14. Set up ARB meeting to approve all changes, approve supplemental accounts, and hold hearings on substantial error motions if needed.
- 15. Ensure that all lawsuits have complied with Section 42.08 payment requirements.
- 16. Review revisions needed for ARB programs and documents and order necessary supplies.
- 17. Present preliminary ratio study results to the BOD.
- 18. Submit updated current year appraisal roll to each taxing unit.
- 19. Continue data entry of changes and updates.
- 20. Prepare for annual mailouts.

#### March, 2025 and 2026:

- 1. Continue work on appeal of Comptroller's ratio study, if necessary.
- 2. Continue updating USPAP (Mass Appraisal Report).
- 3. Continue data entry of field work.
- 4. Continue downloading pictures provided by field appraiser.
- 5. Continue to research returned mail.
- 6. Maintain records management.
- 7. Prepare recap of values for supplemental accounts for the ARB and prepare supplemental logs for the ARB.
- 8. Prepare and key-in new tax agent codes and update changes to existing agent codes.
- 9. Prepare and mail reminders to those who failed to return homestead applications and/or agricultural applications.
- 10. Notify tax assessors/collectors of changes that require refunds.
- 11. Be sure that new ARB members are signed up for the mandatory training course.
- 12. Process rendition extension requests and notify owners or agents of status of request.
- 13. Submit updated appraisal roll to each tax unit.
- 14. Update all schedules provided by Eagle Appraisal & Consulting.

#### April, 2025 and 2026:

- 1. Complete data entry of changes.
- 2. Begin preparation of Notices of Value.
- 3. Mail Notices of Value by May 1.
- 4. Begin compiling information for evidence packets for property owners filing protests and requesting evidence.

- 6. Continue data entry processes.
- 7. Continue to research returned mail.
- 8. Contain to maintain records management.
- **9.** Prepare change logs for the ARB and BOD.
- 10. Purchase sufficient postage for mailing Notices of Value if needed.
- 11. Continue to obtain sales information.
- 12. Notify each tax assessor/collector of changes that require a refund.
- 13. Update website to include new information and current year protest forms.
- 14. Prepare and submit 25.25b reports to the BOD and ARB.
- 15. Continue to receive and process rendition extension requests and notify owners or agents of status of requests.
- 16. Mail letters to taxing units requesting new abatement contracts/TIF Zones for the current year if needed. (This information is to be sent to the Comptroller's Office before July 1.)
- 17. Submit updated appraisal roll information to each tax unit.
- 18. Print Notices of Value.
- 19. Print edits before notices are mailed.
- 20. Continue to develop reports as needed.

#### May, 2025 and 2026:

- 1. Mail Notices of Value.
- 2. Continue to work renditions and new personal property accounts.
- 3. Begin working with property owners regarding proposed values and protests filed.
- 4. Appraisers hold informal hearings with protesting property owners.
- 5. Provide evidence to property owners submitting evidence requests for protest hearings.
- 6. Prepare monthly reports.
- 7. Continue to research returned mail.
- 8. Continue to maintain records management.
- 9. Notify taxing units' tax assessors/collectors of appraisal roll changes that require refunds.
- 10. Process and determine requests for additional 15 days to file renditions (May 30<sup>th</sup> deadline) and mail determinations.
- 11. By May 15th, submit preliminary estimates of value to taxing units.
- 12. By May 15<sup>th</sup>, submit appraisal records to ARB.
- 13. Ensure that all new ARB members have attended mandatory training course and that certificates of completion are on file.
- 14. Publicize protest procedures and deadlines in ¼ page ad in local newspaper.
- 15. Update parcel information on new improvement values due to expired abatements and percent changes.
- 16. Begin scheduling protest hearings and mail Notice of Protest letters and reminder letters as necessary.
- 17. Provide updated appraisal roll information to each taxing unit.
- 18. Mail, as necessary, preliminary ARB change letters, no change letters, unable to contact letters, and homestead letters.
- 19. Prepare new reports as needed.

#### June, 2025 and 2026:

- 1. Mail penalty letters on non-rendered personal property accounts.
- 2. Continue working with property owners regarding proposed values and appraisers continue to hold informal hearings.
- 3. Continue to provide evidence to property owners submitting evidence requests for protest hearings.
- 4. Prepare monthly reports.
- 5. Continue to research returned mail.
- 6. Continue to maintain records management.
- 7. Notify taxing units' tax assessor/collectors of any appraisal roll changes that require refunds.
- 8. ARB hearings to begin or continue as needed.
- 9. Mail ARB certified orders on change, no change determinations.
- 10. Ensure that school districts have a certified estimate of value and that all units have an estimate of value.
- 11. Submit abatement contracts executed and reinvestment zones established by taxing units in prior year to the Property Tax Division (must be done by July 1<sup>st</sup>).
- 12. Prepare proposed AD Budget for the following year and submit to BOD.
- 13. Continue to schedule protest hearings and mail letters and reminder letters as necessary.
- 14. Prepare folders for hearings.
- 15. Post hearing agendas as necessary.
- 16. Submit appraisal roll changes to each taxing unit.
- 17. Submit sales information to State Comptroller's Officer by June 1.
- 18. Obtain deed records and process ownership changes, splits, combines, etc. and ensure that maps are updated to reflect these changes.

#### July, 2025 and 2026:

- 1. Mail all approvals/denials on rendition penalty waiver requests, ARB certified orders and any other necessary correspondence.
- 2. Continue ARB hearings if necessary until all protests have been heard.
- 3. Prepare monthly reports.
- 4. Continue to research returned mail.
- 5. Continue to maintain records management.
- 6. Ensure that all ARB changes have been keyed into computer.
- 7. By July 20<sup>th</sup>, ARB approves the appraisal records for the current year.
- 8. Check appraisal roll and values for substantial errors.
- 9. Provide certified values and recaps to all taxing units by July 25<sup>th</sup> and print certified rolls for each unit.
- 10. Notify taxing units' tax assessor/collectors of appraisal roll changes that require refunds.
- 11. Prepare and submit 25.25(b) quarterly reports to BOD and ARB.
- 12. Begin working on the reappraisal calendar for the following year.

## August, 2025 and 2026:

- 1. Prepare appraisal cards for the appropriate reappraisal area for the field appraisers, attaching permits and recheck notes.
- 2. Prepare reports for the State Comptroller's Office.
- 3. Prepare monthly reports.
- 4. Continue to maintain records management.
- 5. Re-check appraisal roll for substantial errors.
- 6. Generate report of sales information on sales that occurred January 1 through the end of July.
- 7. Begin fieldwork to examine sales, or note these sales for Eagle Appraisal and Consulting appraisers to examine when fieldwork begins in September.
- 8. Field examinations continue through April of the following year.
- 9. Notify taxing units' tax assessors/collectors of appraisal roll changes that require refunds.
- 10. After certification of rolls, send to Texas Department of Economic Development a listing of all sites with values greater than or equal to \$100 million, in compliance with Section 23.23 of the Texas Property Tax code.
- 11. Contact entities on primarily charitable organization exemptions to see if renewal of exemption is needed.
- 12. Have BOD schedule the budget hearing.
- 13. Publicize the budget and budget hearing date.
- 14. Submit updated appraisal roll to each taxing unit.
- 15. Compile all necessary information for the calculating of tax rates and begin calculation process.

#### **September, 2025 and 2026:**

- 1. Complete tax rate calculations, publish effective rates, and assist taxing units in adopting tax rates.
- 2. Order or print tax rolls.
- 3. Ensure that sufficient envelopes, forms, paper, postage, etc. are on hand for printing and mailing statements if mailing from in-house.
- 4. Eagle Appraisal and Consulting appraisers will begin field work.
- 5. Begin working on any arbitration cases.
- 6. Begin working on September 1 inventory parcels.
- 7. Prepare Property Value Reports for State Comptroller's office.
- 8. Begin data entry of changes made by field appraisers and download new pictures taken by field appraisers.
- 9. Prepare monthly reports.
- 10. Continue to maintain records management.
- 11. Notify each taxing units' tax assessor/collector of changes to the appraisal roll that require a refund.
- 12. BOD must adopt the following year's budget by September 15.
- 13. Send State Reports to the Property Tax Division.
- 14. Mail tax statements.

#### October, 2025 and 2026:

- 1. Eagle Appraisal and Consulting field appraisers will continue field inspections.
- 2. Begin working with the Comptroller's office regarding the ratio study.
- 3. Mail completed Reports of Property Value to the State Comptroller's office.
- 4. Continue to key in changes made by field appraisers.
- 5. Continue to download new pictures taken by the field appraisers.
- 6. Prepare monthly reports.
- 7. Continue to maintain records management.
- 8. Notify each taxing units' tax assessor/collector of appraisal roll changes that requires a refund.
- 9. Prepare and submit 25.25(b) change report to BOD and ARB.
- 10. Notify appropriate taxing units of any current year lawsuits.

#### November, 2025 and 2026:

- 1. Eagle Appraisal and Consulting will continue field work.
- 2. Continue working with the Comptroller's office regarding the ratio study.
- 3. Continue keying in changes made by field appraisers and downloading pictures.
- 4. Prepare monthly reports.
- 5. Continue to maintain records management.
- 6. Prepare new homestead exemption applications for mail-out during the first part of January.
- 7. Prepare renditions for mail-out during the first part of January.
- 8. Notify each taxing units' tax assessor/collector of appraisal roll changes that require a refund.
- 9. BOD appoints the following year's Ag Advisory Council at a regular meeting.
- 10. BOD appoints ARB members for the following year at a regular meeting.
- 11. Submit updated appraisal roll information to each taxing unit.

#### December, 2025 and 2026:

- 1. Eagle Appraisal and Consulting field appraisers will continue field work.
- 2. Continue to key in changes provided by the field appraisers and download new pictures.
- 3. Continue to work on arbitration cases and lawsuits.
- 4. Continue working with the Comptroller's office regarding the ratio study.
- 5. Prepare monthly reports.
- 6. Prepare all homestead exemption applications to surviving spouse of deceased for mail out on January 1<sup>st</sup>.
- 7. Notify each taxing units' tax assessor/collectors about any changes to the appraisal roll that requires refunds.
- 8. Submit updated appraisal roll information to the taxing units.

#### 2026 Reappraisal Schedule

The same timetable and duties apply in each year. The field appraiser shall physically inspect all property in as described in Area Two. The chief appraiser and CAD staff shall continue to complete the same duties and reappraisal steps as outlined for 2025.

# EAGLE PROPERTY TAX APPRAISAL & CONSULTING, INC.

## REAPPRAISAL PLAN

2025-2026

#### INTRODUCTION

Passage of Senate Bill 1652 amended Section 6.05 of the Texas Property Tax Code by adding Subsection (i) to read as follows:

(i) To ensure adherence with generally accepted appraisal practices, the board of directors of an appraisal district shall develop biennially a written plan for the periodic reappraisal of all property within the boundaries of the district according to the requirements of Section 25.18 and shall hold a public hearing to consider the plan. Not later than the 10<sup>th</sup> day before the date of the hearing, the secretary shall deliver to the presiding officer of the governing body of each taxing unit participating in the district a written notice of the date, time, and place of the hearing. Not later than September 15 of each even-numbered year, the board shall complete its hearings, make any amendments, and by resolution finally approve the plan. Copies of the approved plan shall be distributed to the presiding officer of the governing body of each taxing unit participating in the district and to the Comptroller within sixty (60) days of the approval date.

#### PLAN FOR PERIODIC REAPPRAISAL REQUIREMENT:

Senate Bill 1652 amends Section 25.18, Subsections (a) and (b) to read as follows:

- (a) Each appraisal office shall implement the Plan for Periodic Reappraisal of Property approved by the board of directors under Section 6.05 (i).
- (b) The plan shall provide for the following reappraisal activities for all real property in the district at least once every three years:
  - identifying properties to be appraised through physical inspection or by other reliable means of identification, including deeds or other legal documentation, aerial photographs, land-based photographs, surveys, maps, and property sketches.
  - 2. identifying and updating relevant characteristics of each property in the appraisal records.
  - 3. defining market areas in the district
  - 4. identifying property characteristics that affect property value in each market area, including the location and market area of property, physical attributes of property such as size, age, and condition, legal and economic attributes, and the identification of easements, covenants, leases, reservations, contracts, declarations, special assessments, ordinances, or legal restrictions.
  - developing an appraisal model that reflects the relationship among the property characteristics affecting value in each market area and determines the contribution of individual property characteristics.
  - 6. applying the conclusions reflected in the model to the characteristics of the properties being appraised; and
  - 7. reviewing the appraisal results to determine value.

#### **REVALUATION DECISION (REAPPRAISAL CYCLE)**

The Cottle CAD, by policy adopted by the Board of Directors and the Chief Appraiser, reappraises all property in the district every year. The reappraisal may consist of field inspections, CAMA, or both. The reappraisal year is a complete appraisal of all properties in the district. Tax year 2025 is a reappraisal year and tax year 2026 is a reappraisal year.

Additionally, every tax year, the district inspects and appraises new construction and adds those properties to the appraisal roll. The district also inspects and reappraises properties that have been remodeled or demolished, properties with additions, properties with fire damage, or properties with any change or damage. These changes are found through building permits issued by the city. However, since building permits are not required for properties outside the city limits, District staff maintains a file of newspaper clippings that pertain to changes in property and all District staff remains alert to visual changes in properties. Throughout the year, notes are made on those visual changes and all information is provided to the field appraiser. The field appraiser will also conduct detailed field inspections of properties if requested by the owner and reappraise these properties as necessary. The district is contracted with Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting, Inc. to perform the commercial appraisals and field inspections.

Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting, Inc. compiles all sales by school district. Problematic areas are further researched and may indicate the use of market modifiers. The use of these modifiers is the predominant method of adjusting sales for location and time. Values throughout the county may be adjusted by use of market modifiers during the reappraisal year.

#### PLANNING AND ORGANIZATION

A calendar of key events with critical completion dates is prepared for each area of work. This calendar identifies key events for appraisal, clerical, customer service, and information systems. A calendar is prepared for the years 2025 and 2026. Production standards for field activities are calculated and incorporated in the planning and scheduling process. Refer to the district's timeline and schedule in the Written Plan for Periodic Reappraisal.

Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting, Inc. will begin field inspections of the district's scheduled reappraisal area on or about the first Tuesday following Labor Day in September 2024 and will complete all inspections and schedules by April 1, 2025, for the 2025 tax year. Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting, Inc. will begin field inspections of the district's scheduled reappraisal area on or about the first Tuesday following Labor Day in September 2025 and will complete all inspections and schedules by April 1, 2026, for the 2026 tax year.

The district shall provide Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting, Inc. appraisers the field cards that contain specific information regarding the property being appraised. These cards contain brief legal descriptions, ownership interests, property use codes, property addresses, land size, and sketches of improvements as well as detailed information of any improvements. Appraisal field inspection procedures require the appraisers to check all information on the field cards and to update the information when necessary. All new improvements shall be measured, classed, and assigned the appropriate depreciation amount. Structures that have been demolished or

removed shall be marked off the appraisal card. Properties with extensive improvement remodeling shall be identified and the field inspection shall identify and update the property characteristic data. The appraiser shall note the date of the inspection on the card and place his initials on the card. The appraiser shall take pictures, with each picture having a date, and note the picture number on the appraisal card.

Each year, Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting, Inc. will test real property market areas, by property classification. The market areas shall be tested for low or high ratio sales and/or high coefficients of dispersion. Market areas that fail any or all of these tests are determined to be problematic. Field inspections are scheduled to verify and/or correct property characteristic data. Additional sales data is researched and verified.

The International Association of Assessing Officers' Standard on Mass Appraisal of Real Property specifies that the universe of properties shall be re-inspected on a cyclical basis of at least once every three years. The re-inspection includes physically viewing the property, photographing, and verifying the accuracy of the existing data. The annual re-inspection requirements for tax years 2025 and 2026 are identified and scheduled in the District's Written Plan for Periodic Reappraisal.

In addition to the three-year cycle set out by the district's reappraisal plan, Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting, Inc. will perform ratio studies annually to determine areas or categories of properties within the CAD which need to be reappraised within the current year based on ratios. Any areas or categories whose ratios are above, or below statutory requirements shall be reappraised in the current year regardless of the area in which they are located. This two-fold approach will insure not only that all residential and commercial property within the CAD is reappraised at least once every three years, but also that all other categories within the CAD are reviewed annually so that the district stays current with respect to market value in those areas where residential and/or commercial property values appear to be changing rapidly.

#### MASS APPRAISAL SYSTEM

#### **REAL PROPERTY VALUATION**

Revisions to cost models, income models, and market models are specified, updated, and tested each year.

Cost schedules are tested with market data (sales) to ensure that the appraisal district is in compliance with Texas Property Tax Code, Section 23.011. Replacement cost new tables as well as depreciation tables are tested for accuracy and uniformity using ratio study tools and compared with cost data from recognized industry leaders. Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting, Inc. utilizes the national publication of cost schedules of Marshall Valuation Services.

Land Schedules are updated using current market data (sales) and then tested with ratio study tools. Value schedules are developed and tested on a pilot basis with ratio study tools.

#### PERSONAL PROPERTY VALUATION

Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting performs personal property valuations only in some Districts.

Density schedules are tested using data received during the previous tax year from renditions and hearing documentation. Valuation procedures are reviewed, modified as needed, and tested.

#### **HEARING PROCESS**

Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting, Inc. representatives conduct informal hearings with protesting property owners. If the protest cannot be settled within the guidelines set out by the district's informal hearings procedures, the property owner may elect to proceed to a formal hearing before the Appraisal Review Board.

Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting, Inc. representatives will be present at formal ARB hearings and will present and defend the appraisals performed. Further, Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting, Inc. will provide the district with the calculations of schedules and final schedules.

#### STAFFING:

Eagle Property Tax Appraisal & Consulting, Inc. contracts with appraisers who are certified or are working on obtaining certification. Contractors are assigned to various counties but may also work with any of the company's contracted appraisal districts. A list of all contractors is attached and is subject to change.

|  |   |   | • |
|--|---|---|---|
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   | • |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  | • |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |
|  |   |   |   |



#### S.B. 1652\* BIENNIAL REAPPRAISAL PLAN

## FOR THE ANNUAL APPRAISAL FOR AD VALOREM TAX PURPOSES OF MINERAL, INDUSTRIAL, UTILITY AND RELATED PERSONAL PROPERTY

For Tax Years:

2025 and 2026\*\*

**Originally Printed: July 2024** 

\*\*This biennial reappraisal plan is largely predicated on the Scope of Work Rule in the most recent version of Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) promulgated by The Appraisal Foundation's Appraisal Standards Board (ASB). The 2024 edition of USPAP has an effective start date but no end date. Because the standards have matured, the ASB now states that the need for the standards to be updated on a regular basis has decreased. Therefore, the 2024 USPAP will be effective for an indeterminate number of tax years, or until the next USPAP version is produced.

"To ensure adherence with generally accepted appraisal practices, the board of directors of an appraisal district shall develop biennially a written plan for the periodic reappraisal of all property within the boundaries of the district according to the requirements of Section 25.18 and shall hold a public hearing to consider the proposed plan. Not later than the 10th day before the date of the hearing, the secretary of the board shall deliver to the presiding officer of the governing body of each taxing unit participating in the district a written notice of the date, time, and place for the hearing. Not later than September 15 of each even-numbered year, the board shall complete its hearings, make any amendments, and by resolution finally approve the plan. Copies of the approved plan shall be distributed to the presiding officer of the governing body of each taxing unit participating in the district and to the comptroller within 60 days of the approval date."

<sup>\*</sup>Senate Bill 1652 passed by the Texas Legislature, 79th Regular Session in 2005, amending Section 6.05 of the Texas Property Tax Code, adding Subsection (i) as follows:



#### **Table of Contents**

| <u>Item</u>  | <u>Page</u> |
|--|-------------|
| P&A POLICY STATEMENT   | 2           |
| PREAMBLE   | 5           |
| ETHICS RULE  | 6           |
| RECORD KEEPING RULE  |             |
| SCOPE OF WORK RULE   |             |
| JURISDICTIONAL EXCEPTION RULE                                    | 13          |
| STANDARDS 5 & 6: MASS APPRAISAL, DEVELOPMENT AND REPORTING (     | General) 14 |
| STANDARDS 5, 6-1, 6-2: MINERAL INTERESTS                         |             |
| STANDARDS 5, 6-1, 6-2: INDUSTRIAL, UTILITY, AND RELATED PERSONAL | •           |

STATES IN

## POLICY STATEMENT OF PRITCHARD & ABBOTT, INC., ON THE UNIFORM STANDARDS OF PROFESSIONAL APPRAISAL PRACTICE

Pritchard & Abbott, Inc., (P&A), a privately held company engaged primarily, but not wholly, in the ad valorem tax valuation industry endorses Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) as the basis for the production of sound appraisals. Insofar as the statutory requirement to appraise groups (or a "universe") of real and personal property within an established period of time using standardized procedures—and subjecting the resulting appraisals to statistical measures—is the definition of mass appraisal, P&A subscribes to USPAP Standards 5 and 6 (Mass Appraisal, Development and Reporting) whenever applicable in the development and defense of values. When circumstances clearly dictate the use of single property appraisal procedures, P&A adheres to the spirit and intent of the remaining USPAP Standards within all appropriate, practical, and/or contractual limitations or specifications.

A biennial reappraisal plan is, at its core, a discussion of the CAD's intended implementation of the Scope of Work Rule in USPAP. This plan provides general information about this rather comprehensive USPAP rule, as well as the specific steps P&A takes in the actual appraisal of various property types per our contractual obligations. This Biennial Reappraisal Plan should not be confused or conflated with an "appraisal manual" or other "how-to" guide which may or may not exist within P&A for any particular property type we appraise.

This reappraisal plan discusses a few other USPAP rules that interact with the Scope of Work Rule, such as the Ethics Rule, the Record Keeping Rule, and Jurisdictional Exception Rule. For further information regarding other sections of USPAP, including the Competency Rule, definitions, and appraisal reports, please reference P&A's "USPAP report" which accompanies our appraisals and supporting documentation provided to clients per Property Tax Code, Sec. 25.01(c) at the completion of each tax year. An appraisal season thus begins with an appraisal plan (approved by the CAD's Board of Directors) and ends with appraisal reports. Providing these reports is definitely part of the plan. Likewise, much of the verbiage in the "USPAP report" is a reiteration of the Biennial Reappraisal Plan.

USPAP defines "appraisal" as the act or process of developing an opinion of value or pertaining to appraising and related functions such as appraisal practice or appraisal services. Valuation services is defined as services pertaining to an aspect of property value, regardless of the type of service and whether it is performed by appraisers or by others. The USPAP definition of "appraiser" is one who is expected to perform valuation services competently and in a manner that is *independent*, *impartial*, *and objective*. USPAP Advisory Opinion 21: *USPAP Compliance* states that this expectation (by clients and intended users of appraisal reports) is the basis that creates an ethical obligation to comply with USPAP, even if not legally required. Advisory opinions do not establish new standards or interpret existing standards, but instead are issued to illustrate the applicability of appraisal standards in specific situations.

The majority of property types that P&A typically appraises for ad valorem tax purposes are categorized as unique, complex, and/or "special purpose" properties (mineral interests, industrial, utility, and related personal property). These categories of properties do not normally provide sufficient market data of reliable quality and/or quantity to support the rigorous use of all USPAP-prescribed mass appraisal development mandates (Standard 5: Mass Appraisal, Development), particularly with regards to some, but not all, of the *model calibration* and *statistical performance testing* confines. However, P&A does strive to employ all or most elements of mass appraisal techniques with regards to the *definition* and *identification of property characteristics* and *model specification* and application.

Per USPAP Advisory Opinion 32: Ad Valorem Property Tax Appraisal and Mass Appraisal Assignments, in the interests of equity, the scope of work in mass appraisal assignments for ad valorem taxation can include consideration of appraisal level (the overall proximity between appraised values and actual prices) and the

uniformity of property values (equity within groups of like properties). The appraiser is responsible for recognizing when the concepts of appraisal level and appraisal uniformity are necessary for credible assignment results in a mass appraisal assignment for ad valorem taxation.

Residential real estate property appraisers most frequently apply mass appraisal methods within the sales comparison (market) approach to value. Through the use of standardized data collection (i.e., actual market sales), specification and calibration of mass appraisal models, tables, and schedules are possible. Through ratio study analysis and other performance measures, a cumulative summary of valuation accuracy can thus be produced in order to calibrate the appraisal model(s). Where sufficient data of reliable quality exists, mass appraisal is also used for other types of real estate property such as farms, vacant lots, and some commercial uses (e.g., apartments, offices, and small retail).

Regarding mass appraisal reports due the client and other intended users per USPAP (Standard 6 (Mass Appraisal, Reporting), a written report of the mass appraisal as described in Standards 6-2 is not provided for each individual property. An individual property record or worksheet may describe the valuation of the specific property after the application of the mass appraisal model. To understand the individual property result developed in a mass appraisal requires the examination of all the information and analysis required by Standards 6-2.

P&A will clearly state or otherwise make known all extraordinary assumptions, hypothetical conditions, limitations imposed by assignment conditions, and/or jurisdictional exceptions in its appraisal reports as they are conveyed to our clients. Intended users of our reports are typically the client(s) for which we are under direct contract. Although taxpayers or their agents who own and/or represent the subject property being appraised often receive these reports either by law or as a courtesy of the client or P&A, this receipt does not mean these parties automatically become Intended Users as defined by USPAP. A party receiving a copy of a report in order to satisfy disclosure requirements does not become an intended user of the appraisal or mass appraisal unless the appraiser specifically identifies such party as an intended user. Potential other users include parties involved in adjudication of valuation disputes (review board members, lawyers, judges, etc.), governmental agencies which periodically review our appraisals for various statutory purposes (such as the Texas Comptroller's Office) and private parties who may obtain copies of our appraisals through Open Records Requests made to governmental agencies.

USPAP does not currently address communications of assignment results prior to completion of the assignment, thus such communications have no requirements other than to comply with the general requirements in the Ethics Rule, the Competency Rule, and the Jurisdictional Exception Rule. The client and all intended users should be aware that mass appraisals, as opposed to most "fee" appraisals, are somewhat inherently "limited" versus "complete" and that appraisal reports, unless otherwise contracted for by the client, will most often be of a "restricted" nature whereas explanations of appraisal methods and results are more concise versus lengthy in order to promote brevity, clarity, and transparency to the intended user(s).

Per USPAP, the appropriate reporting option and level of information in a report are dependant on the intended use and the intended users. Although the reporting verbiage in USPAP Standard 6 does not specifically offer or promulgate a "Restricted Appraisal Report" such as in Standard 2 (Real Property Appraisal, Reporting) and Standard 8 (Personal Property Appraisal, Reporting), it should be noted that: a) all mass appraisals and mass appraisal reports deal with real and personal property in some form or fashion; and b) P&A is a private consulting firm, a fact which may necessitate the withholding of certain data and/or appraisal models/techniques which are deemed confidential, privileged and/or proprietary in nature. The use of "limited" appraisals in conjunction with "restricted" reports in no way implies non-compliance with USPAP. The substantive content of a report determines its compliance.

P&A believes that, with its vast experience and expertise in these areas of appraisal, all concluded values and reports thereof are credible, competent, understandable, uniform and consistent; and most importantly for ad

valorem tax purposes, accomplished in a cost-efficient and timely manner.

Per previous ASB comments under Standard 6-2(b) [scope of work... special limiting conditions]:

"Although appraisers in ad valorem taxation should not be held accountable for limitations beyond their control, they are required by this specific requirement to identify cost constraints and to take appropriate steps to secure sufficient funding to produce appraisals that comply with these standards. Expenditure levels for assessment administration are a function of a number of factors. Fiscal constraints may impact data completeness and accuracy, valuation methods, and valuation accuracy. Although appraisers should seek adequate funding and disclose the impact of fiscal constraints on the mass appraisal process, they are not responsible for constraints beyond their control."

In any event, however, it is not P&A's intent to allow constraints, fiscal or otherwise, to limit the scope of work to such a degree that the mass appraisal results provided to our clients are not credible within the context of the intended use(s) of the appraisal.

#### **PREAMBLE**

The purpose of USPAP is to establish requirements and conditions for ethical, thorough, and transparent property valuation services. Valuation services pertain to all aspects of property value and include services performed by appraisers and other professionals including attorneys, accountants, insurance estimators, auctioneers, or brokers. Valuation services include appraisal, appraisal review, and appraisal consulting. The primary intent of these Standards is to promote and maintain a high level of public trust in professional appraisal practice.

It is essential that professional appraisers develop and communicate their analyses, opinions, and conclusions to intended users of their services in a manner that is meaningful and not misleading. The importance of the role of the appraiser places ethical obligations upon those who serve in this capacity. These USPAP Standards reflect the current standards of the appraisal profession.

These Standards are for both appraisers and users of appraisal services. To maintain a high level of professional practice, appraisers observe these Standards. However, these Standards do not in themselves establish which individuals or assignments must comply. The Appraisal Foundation nor its Appraisal Standards Board is not a government entity with the power to make, judge, or enforce law. Compliance with USPAP is only required when either the service or the appraiser is obligated to comply by law or regulation, or by agreement with the client or intended users. When not obligated, individuals may still choose to comply.

USPAP addresses the ethical and performance obligations of appraisers through Definitions, Rules, Standards, Statements (if any), and Advisory Opinions. USPAP Standards deal with the procedures to be followed in performing an appraisal or appraisal review and the manner in which each is communicated. A brief description of the USPAP Standards are as follows:

- Standards 1 and 2: establish requirements for the development and communication of a real property appraisal.
- Standards 3 and 4: establishes requirements for the development and communication of an appraisal review.
- Standards 5 and 6: establishes requirements for the development and communication of a mass appraisal.
- Standards 7 and 8: establish requirements for the development and communication of a personal property appraisal.
- **Standards 9 and 10:** establish requirements for the development and communication of a business or intangible asset appraisal.

Section 23.01(b) [Appraisals Generally] of the Texas Property Tax Code states:

"The market value of property shall be determined by the application of generally accepted appraisal methods and techniques. If the Appraisal District determines the appraised value of a property using mass appraisal standards, the mass appraisal standards must comply with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice..." (underline added for emphasis)

Consequently, USPAP Standards 5 and 6 are assumed to be applicable for ad valorem tax purposes in Texas, if mass appraisal practices are in fact being used to appraise the subject property. USPAP Advisory Opinion 32 suggests several USPAP standards other than Standards 5 or 6 can apply in ad valorem tax work. It appears that an appraiser engaged in ad valorem tax work in Texas is not specifically required by law to rigorously follow USPAP standards if in fact mass appraisal practices have not been used to appraise the subject property. The Jurisdictional Exception Rule could then be invoked because of a contradiction between the requirements of USPAP and the law or regulation of a jurisdiction. Please see the P&A Policy Statement on USPAP as provided elsewhere in this report for a more detailed discussion regarding this matter.

#### **ETHICS RULE**

Because of the fiduciary responsibilities inherent in professional appraisal practice, the appraiser must observe the highest standards of professional ethics. This Ethics Rule is divided into four (4) sections:

- Nondiscrimination;
- Conduct;
- Management;
- Confidentiality.

This Rule emphasizes the personal obligations and responsibilities of the individual appraiser. However, it should be noted that groups and organizations which are comprised of individual appraisers engaged in appraisal practice effectively share the same ethical obligations. To the extent the group or organization does not follow USPAP Standards when legally required, individual appraisers should take steps that are appropriate under the circumstances to ensure compliance with USPAP.

Compliance with these Standards is required when either the service or the appraiser is obligated by law or regulation, or by agreement with the client or intended users, to comply. Compliance is also required when an individual, by choice, represents that he or she is performing the service as an appraiser.

An appraiser must not misrepresent his or her role when providing valuation services that are outside of appraisal practice.

*Honesty, impartiality, and professional competency* are required of all appraisers under USPAP Standards. To document recognition and acceptance of his or her USPAP-related responsibilities in communicating an appraisal or appraisal review completed under USPAP, an appraiser is required to certify compliance with these Standards.

#### **NONDISCRIMINATION**

An appraiser must not act in a manner that violates or contributes to a violation of federal, state, or local antidiscrimination laws or regulations. This includes the Fair Housing Act (FHAct), the Equal Credit Opportunity Act (ECOA), and the Civil Rights Act of 1866.

An appraiser must have knowledge of anti-discrimination laws and regulations and when those laws or regulations apply to the appraiser or to the assignment. An appraiser must complete an assignment in full compliance with applicable laws and regulations.

- 1. An appraiser, when completing a residential real property assignment, must not base their opinion of value in whole or in part on race, color, religion, national origin, sex, disability, or familial status.
- 2. An appraiser, when completing an assignment where the intended use is in connection with a credit transaction, not limited to credit secured by real property, must not base their opinion of value in whole or in part on race, color, religion, national origin, sex, marital status, age, source of income, or the good-faith exercise of rights under the Consumer Credit Protection Act.
- 3. An appraiser must not violate any state or local anti-discrimination laws or regulations applicable to the appraiser or to their assignment.

Whether or not any anti-discrimination law or regulation applies:

- 1. An appraiser must not develop and/or report an opinion of value that, in whole or in part, is based on the actual or perceived race, ethnicity, color, religion, national origin, sex, sexual orientation, gender, gender identity, gender expression, marital status, familial status, age, receipt of public assistance income, or disability of any person(s).
- 2. An appraiser must not base an opinion of value upon the premise that homogeneity of the inhabitants of a geographic area is relevant for the appraisal.
- 3. An appraiser must not perform an assignment with bias with respect to the actual or perceived race, ethnicity, color, religion, national origin, sex, sexual orientation, gender, gender identity, gender expression, marital status, familial status, age, receipt of public assistance income, or disability of any person(s).
- 4. An appraiser must not use or rely upon another characteristic as a pretext to conceal the use of or reliance upon race, ethnicity, color, religion, national origin, sex, sexual orientation, gender, gender identity, gender expression, marital status, familial status, age, receipt of public assistance income, or disability of any person(s), when performing an assignment.

If an assignment does not involve residential real property and the intended use is not in connection with a credit transaction, the FHAct and ECOA do not apply. If the FHAct and ECOA do not apply, and no other law or regulation prohibits the use of or reliance upon a protected characteristic,5 then the use of or reliance upon that characteristic is permitted only to the extent that it is essential to the assignment and necessary for credible assignment results.

#### CONDUCT

An appraiser must perform assignments with impartiality, objectivity, and independence, and without accommodation of personal interests.

#### An appraiser:

- must not perform an assignment with bias;
- must not advocate the cause or interest of any party or issue;
- must not accept an assignment that includes the reporting of predetermined opinions and conclusions;
- must not misrepresent his or her role when providing valuation services that are outside of appraisal practice;
- must not communicate assignment results with the intent to mislead or to defraud;
- must not use or communicate a report or assignment results known by the appraiser to be misleading or fraudulent;
- must not knowingly permit an employee or other person to communicate a report or assignment results that are misleading or fraudulent report;
- must not engage in criminal conduct;
- must not willfully or knowingly violate the requirements of the RECORD KEEPING RULE; and must not perform an assignment in a grossly negligent manner.

If known prior to accepting an assignment, and/or if discovered at any time during the assignment, an appraiser must disclose to the client, and in each subsequent report certification:

- any current or prospective interest in the subject property or parties involved; and
- any services regarding the subject property performed by the appraiser within the three year period immediately preceding acceptance of the assignment, as an appraiser or in any other capacity.

The appraiser can agree with the client to keep the mere occurrence of a prior appraisal assignment confidential. If an appraiser has agreed with the client not to disclose that he or she has appraised a property, the appraiser must decline all subsequent assignment that fall with the three year period. In assignments is which there is no report, only the initial disclosure to the client is required.

Presumably all parties in ad valorem tax appraisal will be aware of the ongoing yearly nature of the appraisal assignments performed by valuation consulting firms like Pritchard & Abbott, Inc.—i.e., it will not be confidential—so that this particular conduct instruction is more or less a moot point (regarding the three year period discussed) if the prior service is in fact the ad valorem tax appraisals performed in previous tax years.

#### **MANAGEMENT**

The payment of a fee, commission, or a thing of value by the appraiser in connection with the procurement of an assignment must be disclosed. This disclosure must appear in the certification and in any transmittal letter in which conclusions of value are stated; however, the disclosure of the amount paid is not required. Intra-company payments to employees of groups or organizations involved in appraisal practice for business development do not require disclosure.

It is unethical for an appraiser to accept compensation for performing an assignment when it is contingent upon the reporting of a predetermined result, a direction in assignment results that favors the cause of the client, the amount of a value opinion, the attainment of a stipulated result, or the occurrence of a subsequent event directly related to the appraiser's opinions and specific to the assignment's purpose.

Advertising for or *soliciting assignments in a manner that is false, misleading, or exaggerated* is unethical. Decisions regarding finder or referral fees, contingent compensation, and advertising may not be the responsibility of an individual appraiser, but for a particular assignment it is the responsibility of the individual appraiser to ascertain that there has been no breach of ethics, that the assignment consulting assignment has been prepared in accordance with USPAP Standards, and that the report can be properly certified when required by USPAP Standards 2-3, 4-3, 6-3, 8-3, or 10-3.

An appraiser must affix, or authorize the use of, his or her signature to certify recognition and acceptance of his or her USPAP responsibilities in an appraisal or appraisal review assignment. An appraiser may authorize the use of his or her signature only on an assignment-by-assignment basis.

In addition, an appraiser must not affix the signature of another appraiser without his or her consent. An appraiser must exercise due care to prevent unauthorized use of his or her signature. However, an appraiser exercising such care is not responsible for unauthorized use of his or her signature.

#### CONFIDENTIALITY

An appraiser must protect the confidential nature of the appraiser-property owner relationship.

An appraiser must act in good faith with regard to the legitimate interests of the client in the use of confidential information and in the communication of assignment results.

An appraiser must be aware of, and comply with, all confidentiality and privacy laws and regulations applicable in an assignment.

An appraiser must not disclose confidential factual data obtained from a property owner to anyone other than:

- 1. The client;
- 2. Parties specifically authorized by the client;
- 3. State appraiser regulatory agencies;
- 4. Third parties as may be authorized by due process of law; or
- 5. A duly authorized professional peer review committee except when such disclosure to a committee would violate applicable law or regulation.

An appraiser must take reasonable steps to safeguard access to confidential information and assignment results by unauthorized individuals, whether such information or results are in physical or electronic form. In addition, an appraiser must ensure that employees, coworkers, subcontractors, or others who may have access to confidential information or assignments results, are aware of the prohibitions on disclosure of such information or results.

It is unethical for a member of a duly authorized professional peer review committee to disclose confidential information presented to the committee.

When all confidential elements of confidential information are removed through redaction or the process of aggregation, client authorization is not required for the disclosure of the remaining information, as modified.

#### RECORD KEEPING RULE

An appraiser must prepare a workfile for each appraisal or appraisal review assignment. A workfile must be in existence prior to the issuance of any report or other communication of assignment results. A written summary of an oral report must be added to the workfile within a reasonable time after the issuance of the oral report.

The workfile must include the name of the client and the identity, by name or type, of any other intended users, and true copies of all written reports, documented on any type of media. (A true copy is a replica of the report transmitted to the client. A photocopy or an electronic copy of the entire report transmitted to the client satisfies the requirement of a true copy.) A workfile must contain summaries of all oral reports or testimony, or a transcript of testimony, including the appraiser's signed and dated certification; and all other data, information, and documentation necessary to support the appraiser's opinions and conclusions and to show compliance with USPAP, or references to the location(s) of such other data, information, and documentation.

A workfile in support of a Restricted Appraisal Report or an oral appraisal report must be sufficient for the appraiser to produce an Appraisal Report. A workfile in support of an oral appraisal review report must be sufficient for the appraiser to produce an Appraisal Review Report.

An appraiser must retain the workfile for a period of at least *five years after preparation* or at least two years after final disposition of any judicial proceeding in which the appraiser provided testimony related to the assignment, whichever period expires last.

An appraiser must have custody of the workfile, or make appropriate workfile retention, access, and retrieval arrangements with the party having custody of the workfile. This includes ensuring that a workfile is stored in a medium that is retrievable by the appraiser throughout the prescribed record retention period. An appraiser having custody of a workfile must allow other appraisers with workfile obligations related to an assignment appropriate access and retrieval for the purpose of:

- submission to state appraiser regulatory agencies;
- compliance with due process of law;
- submission to a duly authorized professional peer review committee; or
- compliance with retrieval arrangements.

A workfile must be made available by the appraiser when required by a state appraiser regulatory agency or due process of law.

An appraiser who willfully or knowingly fails to comply with the obligations of this Record Keeping Rule is in violation of the Ethics Rule.

#### SCOPE OF WORK RULE

For each appraisal or appraisal review assignment, an appraiser must:

- 1. Identify the problem to be solved;
- 2. Determine and perform the scope of work necessary to develop credible assignment results; and
- 3. Disclose the scope of work in the report.

An appraiser must properly identify the problem to be solved in order to determine the appropriate scope of work. The appraiser must be prepared to demonstrate that the scope of work is sufficient to produce credible assignment results.

Scope of work includes, but is not limited to:

- the extent to which the property is identified;
- the extent to which tangible property is inspected;
- the type and extent of data researched; and
- the type and extent of analyses applied to arrive at opinions or conclusions.

Appraisers have broad flexibility and significant responsibility in determining the appropriate scope of work for an appraisal or appraisal review assignment. Credible assignment results require support by relevant evidence and logic. The credibility of assignment results is always measured in the context of the intended use.

#### PROBLEM IDENTIFICATION

An appraiser must gather and analyze information about those assignment elements that are necessary to properly identify the appraisal, appraisal review or appraisal consulting problem to be solved. The assignment elements necessary for problem identification are addressed in the Standard 6-2:

- client and any other intended users;
- intended use of the appraiser's opinions and conclusions;
- type and definition of value;
- effective date of the appraiser's opinions and conclusions;
- subject of the assignment and its relevant characteristics; and
- assignment conditions.

This information provides the appraiser with the basis for determining the type and extent of research and analyses to include in the development of an appraisal. Similar information is necessary for problem identification in appraisal review and appraisal consulting assignments. Assignment conditions include:

- assumptions;
- extraordinary assumptions;
- hypothetical conditions;
- laws and regulations;
- · jurisdictional exceptions; and
- other conditions that affect the scope of work.

#### SCOPE OF WORK ACCEPTABILITY

The scope of work must include the research and analyses that are necessary to develop credible assignment results. The scope of work is acceptable when it meets or exceeds:

- the expectations of parties who are regularly intended users for similar assignments; and
- what an appraiser's peers' actions would be in performing the same or a similar assignment.

Determining the scope of work is an ongoing process in an assignment. Information or conditions discovered during the course of an assignment might cause the appraiser to reconsider the scope of work. An appraiser must be prepared to support the decision to exclude any investigation, information, method, or technique that would appear relevant to the client, another intended user, or the appraiser's peers.

An appraiser must not allow assignment conditions to limit the scope of work to such a degree that the assignment results are not credible in the context of the intended use. In addition, the appraiser must not allow the intended use of an assignment or a client's objectives to cause the assignment results to be biased.

#### **DISCLOSURE OBLIGATIONS**

The report must contain sufficient information to allow intended the client and other intended users to understand the scope of work performed. Proper disclosure is required because clients and other intended users may rely on the assignment results. Sufficient information includes disclosure of research and analyses performed or not performed. The information disclosed must be appropriate for the intended use of the assignment results.

Sufficient information includes disclosure of research and analyses performed and might also include disclosure of research and analyses not performed. *The appraiser has broad flexibility and significant responsibility in the level of detail and manner of disclosing the scope of work in the appraisal report or appraisal review report.* The appraiser may, but is not required to, consolidate the disclosure in a specific section or sections of the report, or use a particular label, heading or subheading. An appraiser may choose to disclose the scope of work as necessary throughout the report.

#### JURISDICTIONAL EXCEPTION RULE

If any applicable law or regulation precludes compliance with any part of USPAP, only that part of USPAP becomes void for that assignment. When compliance with USPAP is required by federal law or regulation, no part of USPAP can be voided by a law or regulation of a state or local jurisdiction. When an appraiser properly follows this Rule in disregarding a part of USPAP, there is no violation of USPAP.

In an assignment involving a jurisdictional exception, an appraiser must:

- identify the law or regulation that precludes compliance with USPAP;
- comply with that law or regulation;
- clearly and conspicuously disclose in the report the part of USPAP that is voided by that law or regulation; and
- cite in the report the law or regulation requiring this exception to USPAP compliance.

The purpose of the Jurisdictional Exception Rule is strictly limited to providing a saving or severability clause intended to preserve the balance of USPAP if one or more of its parts are determined as contrary to law or public policy of a jurisdiction. By logical extension, there can be no violation of USPAP by an appraiser who disregards, with proper disclosure, only the part or parts of USPAP that are void and of no force and effect in a particular assignment by operation of legal authority.

It is misleading for an appraiser to disregard a part or parts of USPAP as void and of no force and effect in a particular assignment without identifying the part or parts disregarded and the legal authority justifying this action in the appraiser's report.

"Law" includes constitutions, legislative and court-made law, and administrative rules (such as from the Office of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts) and ordinances. "Regulations" include rules or orders having legal force, issued by an administrative agency. *Instructions from a client or attorney do not establish a jurisdictional exception.* 

A jurisdictional exception prevalent in Texas is that appraisers are seeking to establish "fair market value" as defined by the Texas Property Tax Code instead of "market value" as found in the USPAP definitions section.

## USPAP STANDARDS 5 AND 6: MASS APPRAISAL, DEVELOPMENT AND REPORTING (General Discussion)

In developing a mass appraisal, an appraiser must be aware of, understand, and correctly employ those recognized methods and techniques necessary to produce and communicate credible mass appraisals.

Standards 5 and 6 apply to all mass appraisals of real and personal property regardless of the purpose or use of such appraisals. It is directed toward the substantive aspects of developing and communicating competent analyses, opinions, and conclusions in the mass appraisal of properties, whether real property or personal property. Standard 5 is directed toward the substantive aspects of developing credible analyses, opinions, and conclusions in the mass appraisal of properties, while Standard 6 addresses the content and level of information required in a <u>written</u> report that communicates the results of a mass appraisal. The reporting and jurisdictional exceptions applicable to public mass appraisals prepared for purposes of advalorem taxation do not apply to mass appraisals prepared for other purposes.

#### A mass appraisal includes:

- identifying properties to be appraised;
- defining market areas of consistent behavior that applies to properties;
- identifying characteristics (supply and demand) that affect the creation of value in that market area;
- developing (specifying) a model structure that reflects the relationship among the characteristics affecting value in the market area:
- calibrating the model structure to determine the contribution of the individual characteristics affecting value;
- applying the conclusions reflected in the model to the characteristics of the properties being appraised;
- · reviewing the mass appraisal results.

## The Jurisdictional Exception Rule may apply to several sections of Standards 5 and 6 because ad valorem tax administration is subject to various state, county, and municipal laws.

As previously stated in the P&A Policy Statement (page 2), it may not be possible or practicable for all the mass appraisal attributes listed above to be rigorously applied to the many types of complex and/or unique properties that P&A typically appraises. Often there are contractual limitations on the scope of work needed or required. More prevalently, these types of properties do not normally provide a reliable database of market transactions (or details of transactions) necessary for statistically supportable calibration of appraisal models and review of appraisal results. Generally these two functions are effectively accomplished through annual extended review meetings with taxpayers (and clients) who provide data, sometimes confidentially, that allows for appraisal models to be adjusted where necessary. Nevertheless, and not withstanding whether P&A implicitly or explicitly employs or reports all attributes listed above, in all cases P&A at the minimum employs tenants of "generally accepted appraisal methods" which are the genesis of USPAP Standards.

Per USPAP guidelines, P&A will make known all departures and jurisdictional exceptions when invoked (if an appraisal method or specific requirement is applicable but not necessary to attain credible results in a particular assignment).

The various sections of Standard 5 (development of mass appraisal) and Standard 6 (communication of the mass appraisal results) are briefly summarized below:

- Standard 5-1: Establishes the appraiser's technical and ethical framework. Specifically, appraisers must recognize and use established principles, methods and techniques of appraisal in a careful manner while not committing substantial errors of fact or negligence that would materially affect the appraisal results and not give a credible estimate of fair market value. To this end appraisers must continuously improve his or her skills to maintain proficiency and keep abreast of any new developments in the real and personal property appraisal profession. This Standards does not imply that competence requires perfection, as perfection is impossible to attain. Instead, it requires appraisers to employ every reasonable effort with regards to due diligence and due care.
- Standard 5-2: Defines the introductory framework requirements of developing a mass appraisal, focusing on the identification and/or definition of: client(s), intended users, effective date, appraisal perspective, scope of work, extraordinary assumptions, hypothetical conditions, the type and definition of value being developed (typically "fair market value" for ad valorem tax purposes), characteristics of the property being appraised in relation to the type and definition of value and intended use, the characteristics of the property's market, the property's real or personal attributes, fractional interest applicability, highest and best use analysis along with other land-related considerations, and any other economic considerations relevant to the property.
- Standard 5-3: Defines requirements for developing and specifying appropriate mass appraisal data and elements applicable for real and personal property. For real property, the data and elements include: existing land use regulations, reasonably probable modification of such regulations, economic supply and demand, the physical adaptability of the real estate, neighborhood trends, and highest and best use analysis. For personal property, the relevant data and elements include: identification of industry trends, trade level, highest and best use, and recognition of the appropriate market consistent with the type and definition of value.
- Standard 5-4: Further defines requirements for developing mass appraisal models, focusing on development of standardized data collection forms, procedures, and training materials that are used uniformly on the universe of properties under consideration. This rule specifies that appraisers employ recognized techniques for specifying and calibrating mass appraisal models. Model specification is the formal development of a model in a statement or mathematical equation, including all due considerations for physical, functional, and external market factors as they may affect the appraisal. These models must accurately represent the relationship between property value and supply and demand factors, as represented by quantitative and qualitative property characteristics. Models must be calibrated using recognized techniques, including, but not limited to, multiple linear regression, nonlinear regression, and adaptive estimation. Models may be specified incorporating the income, market, and/or cost approaches to value and may be tabular, mathematical, linear, nonlinear, or any other structure suitable for representing the observable property characteristics such as adaptive estimation. Model calibration refers to the process of analyzing sets of property and market data to determine the specific parameters of a model.
- Standard 5-5: Defines requirements for collection of sufficient factual data, in both qualitative and quantitative terms, necessary to produce credible appraisal results. The property characteristics collected must be contemporaneous with the effective date of the appraisal. The data collection program should incorporate a quality control procedure, including checks and audits of the data to ensure current and consistent records. This rule also calls for calls for an appraiser, in developing income and expense statements and cash flow projections, to weigh historical information and trends, current market factors affecting such trends, and reasonably anticipated events, such as competition from developments either planned or under construction. Terms and conditions of any leases should be analyzed, as well as the need for and extent of any physical inspection of the properties being appraised.

- Standard 5-6: Defines requirements for application of a calibrated model to the property being appraised. This rule calls for: the appraiser to recognize methods or techniques based on the cost, market, and income approaches for improved parcels; the appraiser to value sites by recognized methods or techniques such as allocation method, abstraction method, capitalization of ground rent, and land residual; the appraiser to develop value of leased fee or leasehold estates with consideration for terms and conditions of existing leases, and, when applicable by law, as if held in fee simple whereas market rents are substituted for actual contract rents; the appraiser to analyze the effect on value, if any, of the assemblage of the various parcels, divided interests, or component parts of a property; the appraiser to analyze anticipated public or private improvements located on or off the site, and analyze the effect on value, if any, of such anticipated improvements to the extent they are reflected in market actions.
- Standard 5-7: Defines the reconciliation process of a mass appraisal. Specifically, appraisers must analyze the results and/or applicability of the various approaches used while ensuring that, on an overall basis, standards of reasonableness and accuracy are maintained with the appraisal model selected (underline added for emphasis). It is implicit in mass appraisal that, even when properly specified and calibrated models are used, some individual value conclusions will not meet standards of reasonableness, consistency, and accuracy. Appraisers have a professional responsibility to ensure that, on an overall basis, models produce value conclusions that meet attainable standards of accuracy.
- Standard 6-1: Defines general requirements of a mass appraisal report which is required to be in writing; no option exists for oral reports. This standard addresses the level of information required so that the report is clearly understood (i.e., not misleading) and sufficiently qualified with any assumptions and conditions (elements of which are further detailed in the next three sections of this report that discuss P&A appraisal procedures with regards to specific categories of property).
- Standard 6-2: Defines specific content required to be included in a mass appraisal written report.
- Standard 6-3: Defines the certification of the mass appraisal written report.

The following sections of this report discuss in more detail the various elements of the development of P&A's mass appraisals and associated written reports as required by USPAP Standards 5 and 6, with regards to P&A appraisal of Mineral Interests, Industrial, Utility, Related Personal Property, and Real Estate.

#### USPAP STANDARDS 5, 6-1, 6-2: MASS APPRAISAL OF MINERAL INTERESTS

#### INTRODUCTION

<u>Definition of Appraisal Responsibility (Scope of Effort)</u>: The Mineral Valuation Department of Pritchard & Abbott, Inc. ("P&A" hereinafter), is responsible for developing credible values for mineral interests (full or fractional percentage ownership of oil and gas leasehold interest, the amount and type of which are legally and/or contractually created and specified through deeds and leases, et.al.) associated with producing (or capable of producing) leases. Mineral interests are typically considered <u>real property</u> because of their derivation from the bundle of rights associated with original fee simple ownership of land. Typically all the mineral interests that apply to a single producing lease are consolidated by type (working vs. royalty) with each type then appraised for full value which is then distributed to the various fractional decimal interest owners prorata to their individual type and percentage amount.

P&A's typical client is a governmental entity charged with appraisal responsibility for ad valorem tax purposes, although other types of clients (private businesses, individuals, etc.) occasionally contract for appraisal services which are strictly for various non-ad valorem tax purposes so that no conflicts of interest are created with P&A's core ad valorem tax work.

P&A hereby makes the **assumption** that, in all appraisal assignments performed for governmental entities in satisfaction of contractual obligations related to ad valorem tax, the client does not wish to or cannot legally request the appraisal report not identify the client.

Intended users of our reports are typically the client(s) for which we are under direct contract. Although taxpayers or their agents who own and/or represent the subject property being appraised often receive these reports either by law or as a courtesy of the client or P&A, this receipt does not mean these parties automatically become Intended Users as defined by USPAP. A party receiving a copy of a report in order to satisfy disclosure requirements does not become an intended user of the appraisal or mass appraisal unless the appraiser specifically identifies such party as an intended user. Potential other users include parties involved in adjudication of valuation disputes (review board members, lawyers, judges, etc.), governmental agencies which periodically review our appraisals for various statutory purposes (such as the Texas Comptroller's Office) and private parties who may obtain copies of our appraisals through Open Records Requests made to governmental agencies.

This section of P&A's USPAP report is not applicable to any mineral or mineral interest property that an appraisal district appraises outside of P&A's appraisal services, in which case the appraisal district's overall USPAP report should be referenced.

P&A makes the **Extraordinary Assumption** that all properties appraised for ad valorem tax purposes are marketable whereas ownership and title to property are free of encumbrances and other restrictions that would affect fair market value to an extent not obvious to the general marketplace. If and/or when we are made aware of any encumbrances, etc., these would be taken into account in our appraisal in which case the extraordinary assumption stated above would be revoked.

P&A is typically under contract to determine <u>current</u> market value or "fair market value" of said mineral interests. Fair market value is typically described as the price at which a property would sell for if:

- exposed in the open market with a reasonable time for the seller to find a purchaser;
- both the buyer and seller know of all the uses and purposes to which the property is, or can be, adapted and of the enforceable restrictions on its use; and

• both the buyer and seller seek to maximize their gains and neither is in a position to take advantage of the exigencies of the other. [Exigencies are pressing or urgent conditions that leave one party at a disadvantage to the other.]

For ad valorem tax purposes the effective date is usually legislatively specified by the particular State in which we are working - for example, in Texas the lien date is January 1 per the Texas Property Tax Code. For ad valorem tax purposes, the date of the appraisals and reports are typically several months past the effective date, thereby leaving open the possibility that a <u>retrospective</u> approach is appropriate under limited and prescribed circumstances (information after the effective date being applicable only if it confirms a trend or other appraisal condition that existed and was generally known as of the effective date).

P&A believes this section of this report, in conjunction with any attached or separately provided P&A-generated report(s), meets the USPAP definition of "typical practice"; i.e., it satisfies a level of work that is consistent with:

- the expectations of participants in the market for the same or similar appraisal services; and
- what P&A's peers' actions would be in performing the same or similar appraisal services in compliance with USPAP.

Legal and Statutory Requirements: In Texas, the provisions of the Texas Property Tax Code and other relevant legislative measures involving appraisal administration and procedures control the work of P&A as an extension of the Appraisal District. Other states in which P&A is employed will have similar controlling legislation, regulatory agencies, and governmental entities. P&A is responsible for appraising property on the basis of its fair market value as of the stated effective date (January 1 in Texas) for ad valorem tax purposes for each taxing unit that imposes ad valorem taxes on property in the contracted Appraisal District. All mineral properties (interests) are reappraised annually. The definition of Fair Market Value is provided and promulgated for use in ad valorem tax work in Texas by the Texas Property Tax Code, and therefore as a Jurisdictional Exception supercedes the definition of "market value" as found in USPAP definitions.

NOTE: IN TEXAS, P&A BELIEVES THE PROPERTY BEING APPRAISED AND PLACED ON THE TAX ROLL IS THE INTEREST AND NOT THE OIL OR GAS MINERAL ITSELF, PER PROPERTY TAX CODE SECTION 1.04(2)(F). WHILE OIL AND GAS RESERVES CERTAINLY HAVE VALUE, THE FACT IS THAT IT IS THE INTERESTS IN THESE MINERALS THAT ARE BOUGHT AND SOLD, NOT THE MINERALS THEMSELVES. THE SALE OF MINERALS AS THEY ARE EXTRACTED FROM THE SUBSURFACE OF THE LAND WHERE THEY RESIDE AS MINERALS IN PLACE "MONETIZES" THE INTEREST AND THUS GIVES THE INTEREST ITS VALUE. WHENEVER P&A REFERS TO "MINERAL PROPERTIES" IN THIS REPORT OR IN ANY OTHER SETTING, IT IS THE MINERAL INTEREST, AND NOT THE MINERAL ITSELF, THAT IS THE SUBJECT OF THE REFERENCE.

Administrative Requirements: P&A endorses the principals of the International Association of Assessing Officers (IAAO) regarding its appraisal practices and procedures. P&A also endorses, and follows when possible, the standards promulgated by the Appraisal Foundation known as the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP). In all cases where IAAO and/or USPAP requirements cannot be satisfied for reasons of practicality or irrelevancy, P&A subscribes to "generally accepted appraisal methods and techniques" so that its value conclusions are credible and defendable. P&A submits annual or biannual contract bids to the Appraisal District Board of Directors or the Office of the Chief Appraiser and is bound to produce appraisal estimates on mineral properties within the cost constraints of said bid. Any appraisal practices and procedures followed by P&A not explicitly defined or allowed through IAAO or USPAP requirements are specified by the Texas Property Tax Code or at the specific request or direction of the Office of the Chief Appraiser.

#### **Appraisal Resources**

<u>Personnel</u>: The Mineral Valuation Division staff consists of competent Petroleum Engineers, Geologists, and Appraisers. All personnel are Registered Professional Appraisers with the State of Texas, or are progressing towards this designation within the allowable time frames prescribed by the Texas Department of Licensing and Regulation (TDLR) and/or other licensing and regulatory agencies as applicable.

<u>Data</u>: For each mineral property a common set of data characteristics (i.e. historical production, price and expense data) is collected from various sources and entered into P&A's mainframe computer system. Historical production data and price data is available through state agencies (Texas Railroad Commission, Texas Comptroller, et al.) or private firms who gather, format and repackage such data for sale commercially. Each property's characteristic data drives the computer-assisted mass appraisal approach to valuation.

<u>Information Systems</u>: The mainframe systems are augmented by the databases that serve the various in-house and 3<sup>rd</sup>-party applications on desktop personal computers. In addition, communication and dissemination of appraisals and other information is available to the taxpayer and client through electronic means including internet and other phone-line connectivity. The appraiser supervising any given contract fields many of the public's questions or redirects them to the proper department personnel.

#### VALUATION APPROACH (MODEL SPECIFICATION)

<u>Concepts of Value</u>: The valuation of oil and gas properties is not an exact science, and exact accuracy is not attainable due to many factors. Nevertheless, standards of reasonable performance do exist, and there are usually reliable means of measuring and applying these standards.

Petroleum properties are subject to depletion, and capital investment must be returned before economic exhaustion of the resource (mineral reserves). The examination of petroleum properties involves understanding the geology of the resource (producing and non-producing), type of reservoir energy, the methods of secondary and enhanced recovery (if applicable), and the surface treatment and marketability of the produced petroleum product(s).

Evaluation of mineral properties is a continuous process; the value as of the lien date merely represents a "snapshot" in time. The potential value of mineral interests derived from sale of minerals to be extracted from the ground change with mineral price fluctuation in the open market, changes in extraction technology, costs of extraction, and other variables such as the value of money.

#### Approaches to Value for Petroleum Property

Cost Approach: The use of cost data in an appraisal for market value is based upon the economic principle of substitution. The cost approach typically derives value by a model that begins with replacement cost new (RCN) and then applies depreciation in all its forms (physical depreciation, functional and economic obsolescence). This method is difficult to apply to oil and gas properties since lease acquisition and development may bear no relation to present worth. Though very useful in the appraisal of many other types of properties, the cost approach is not readily applicable to mineral properties. [Keep in mind that the property actually being appraised is the mineral interest and not the oil and gas reserves themselves. Trying to apply the cost approach to evaluation of mineral interests is like trying to apply the cost approach to land; it is a moot point because both are real properties that are inherently non-replaceable.] As a general rule, and for the reasons stated above, Pritchard & Abbott, Inc., does not employ the cost approach in the appraisal of mineral interests.

Market Approach: This approach may be defined as one which uses data available from actual transactions recorded in the market place itself; i.e., sales of comparable properties from which a comparison to the subject

property can be made. Ideally, this approach's main advantage involves not only an opinion but an opinion supported by the actual spending of money. Although at first glance this approach seems to more closely incorporate the aspects of fair market value per its classical definition, there are two factors that severely limit the usefulness of the market approach for appraising oil and gas properties. First, oil and gas property sales data is seldom disclosed (in non-disclosure states such as Texas); consequently there is usually a severe lack of market data sufficient for meaningful statistical analysis. Second, all conditions of each sale must be known and carefully investigated to be sure one does have a comparative indicator of value per fair market value perquisites.

Many times when these properties do change hands, it is generally through company mergers and acquisitions where other assets in addition to oil and gas reserves are involved; this further complicates the analysis whereby a total purchase price must be allocated to the individual components - a speculative and somewhat arbitrary task at best. In the case of oil and gas properties, a scarcity of sales requires that every evidence of market data be investigated and analyzed. Factors relative to the sale of oil and gas properties are:

- current production and estimated declines forecast by the buyer;
- estimated probable and potential reserves;
- general lease and legal information which defines privileges or limitation of the equity sold;
- undeveloped potential such as secondary recovery prospects;
- · proximity to other production already operated by the purchaser;
- contingencies and other cash equivalents; and
- other factors such as size of property, gravity of oil, etc.

In the event that all these factors are available for analysis, the consensus effort would be tantamount to performing an income approach to value (or trying to duplicate the buyer's income approach to value), thereby making the market approach somewhat moot in its applicability. As a general rule, and for the reasons stated above, Pritchard & Abbott, Inc., rarely employs a rigorous application of the market approach in the appraisal of mineral interests.

<u>Income Approach</u>: This approach to value most readily yields itself to the appraisal of mineral interests. Data is readily available whereby a model can be created that reasonable estimates a future income stream to the property. This future income may then be converted (discounted) into an estimate of current value. Many refer to this as a capitalization method, because capitalization is the process of converting an income stream into a capital sum (value). As with any method, the final value is no better than the reliability of the input data. The underlying assumption is that people purchase the property for the future income the property will yield. If the land or improvements are of any residual value after the cessation of oil and gas production, that value should also be included (if those components are also being appraised).

The relevant income that should be used is the expected future net income. Assumptions of this method are:

- Past income and expenses are not a consideration, except insofar as they may be a guide to estimating future net income.
- That the producing life as well as the reserves (quantity of the minerals) are estimated for the property.
- Future income is less valuable than current income, and so future net income must be discounted to make it equivalent to the present income. This discount factor reflects the premium of present money over future money, i.e., interest rate, liquidity, investment management, and risk.

As a general rule, and for the reasons stated above, Pritchard & Abbott, Inc., relies predominantly on the income approach to value in the appraisal of mineral interests.

#### DATA COLLECTION/VALIDATION

Sources of Data: The main source of P&A's property data is data from the Railroad Commission of Texas as reported by operators. As a monthly activity, the data processing department receives data tapes or electronic files which have updated and new well and production data. Other discovery tools are fieldwork by appraisers, financial data from operators, information from chief appraisers, tax assessors, trade publications and city and local newspapers. Other members of the public often provide P&A information regarding new wells and other useful facts related to property valuation.

Another crucial set of data to obtain is the ownership of these mineral interests. Typically a mineral lease is fractionated and executed with several if not many owners. This information is typically requested (under a promise of confidentiality concerning owners' personal information) from pipeline purchasers and/or other entities (such as operators) who have the responsibility of disbursing the income to the mineral interest owners. Another source of ownership information is through the taxpayers themselves who file deeds of ownership transfer and/or correspond with P&A or the appraisal district directly.

<u>Data Collection Procedures</u>: Electronic and field data collection requires organization, planning and supervision of the appraisal staff. Data collection procedures for mineral properties are generally accomplished globally by the company; i.e., production and price data for the entire state is downloaded at one time into the computer system. Appraisers also individually gather and record specific and particular information to the appraisal file records, which serves as the basis for the valuation of mineral properties. P&A is divided into four district offices covering different geographic areas. Each office has a district manager, appraisal and ownership maintenance staff, and clerical staff as appropriate. While overall standards of performance are established and upheld for the various district offices, quality of data is emphasized as the goal and responsibility of each appraiser.

#### VALUATION ANALYSIS (MODEL CALIBRATION)

Appropriate revisions and/or enhancements of schedules or discounted cash flow software are annually made and then tested prior to the appraisals being performed. Calibration typically involves performing multiple discounted cash flow tests for leases with varying parameter input to check the correlation and relationship of such indicators as: Dollars of Value Per Barrel of Reserves; Dollars of Value Per Daily Average Barrel Produced; Dollars of Expense Per Daily Average Barrel Produced; Years Payout of Purchase Price (Fair Market Value). In a more classical calibration procedure, the validity of values by P&A's income approach to value is tested against actual market transactions, if and when these transactions and verifiable details of these transactions are disclosed to P&A. Of course these transactions must be analyzed for meeting all requisites of fair market value definition. Any conclusions of this analysis are then compared to industry benchmarks for reasonableness before being incorporated into the calibration procedure.

#### INDIVIDUAL VALUE REVIEW PROCEDURES

Individual property values are reviewed several times in the appraisal process. P&A's discounted cash flow software dynamically generates various benchmark indicators that the appraiser reviews concurrent with the value being generated. These benchmarks often prompt the appraiser to reevaluate some or all of the parameters of data entry so as to arrive at a value more indicative of industry standards. Examples of indicators are dollars of value per barrel of oil reserve, years payout, etc. In addition to appraiser review, taxpayers are afforded the opportunity to review the appraised values, either before or after Notices of Appraised Value are prepared. Operators routinely meet with P&A's appraisers to review parameters and to provide data not readily available to P&A through public or commercial sources, such as individual lease operating expense and reserve figures. And of

course, all property values are subject to review through normal protest and Appraisal Review Board procedures, with P&A acting as an extension of the Office of the Chief Appraiser.

#### **PERFORMANCE TESTS**

An independent test of the appraisal performance of properties appraised by P&A is conducted by the State of Texas Comptroller's Office through the annual Property Value Study for school funding purposes. This study determines the degree of uniformity and the median level of appraisal for mineral properties. School jurisdictions are given an opportunity to appeal any preliminary findings. After the appeal process is resolved, the Comptroller publishes a report of the findings of the study, including in the report the median level of appraisal, the coefficient of dispersion around the median level of appraisal and any other standard statistical measures that the Comptroller considers appropriate.

### USPAP STANDARDS 5, 6-1, 6-2: MASS APPRAISAL OF INDUSTRIAL, UTILITY AND RELATED PERSONAL PROPERTY

#### INTRODUCTION

<u>Definition of Appraisal Responsibility (Scope of Effort)</u>: The Engineering Services Department of Pritchard & Abbott, Inc. (P&A) is responsible for developing fair and uniform market values for industrial, utility and personal properties.

P&A's typical client is a governmental entity charged with appraisal responsibility for ad valorem tax purposes, although other types of clients (private businesses, individuals, etc.) occasionally contract for appraisal services which are strictly for various non-ad valorem tax purposes so that no conflicts of interest are created with P&A's core ad valorem tax work.

P&A hereby makes the **assumption** that, in all appraisal assignments performed for governmental entities in satisfaction of contractual obligations related to ad valorem tax, the client does not wish to or cannot legally request the appraisal report not identify the client.

Intended users of our reports are typically the client(s) for which we are under direct contract. Although taxpayers or their agents who own and/or represent the subject property being appraised often receive these reports either by law or as a courtesy of the client or P&A, this receipt does not mean these parties automatically become Intended Users as defined by USPAP. A party receiving a copy of a report in order to satisfy disclosure requirements does not become an intended user of the appraisal or mass appraisal unless the appraiser specifically identifies such party as an intended user. Potential other users include parties involved in adjudication of valuation disputes (review board members, lawyers, judges, etc.), governmental agencies which periodically review our appraisals for various statutory purposes (such as the Texas Comptroller's Office) and private parties who may obtain copies of our appraisals through Open Records Requests made to governmental agencies.

This section of P&A's USPAP report is not applicable to any Industrial, Utility, or related Personal Property that an appraisal district appraises outside of P&A's appraisal services, in which case the appraisal district's overall USPAP report should be referenced.

P&A makes the **Extraordinary Assumption** that all properties appraised for ad valorem tax purposes are marketable whereas ownership and title to property are free of encumbrances and other restrictions that would affect fair market value to an extent not obvious to the general marketplace. If and/or when we are made aware of any encumbrances, etc., these would be taken into account in our appraisal in which case the extraordinary assumption stated above would be revoked.

P&A is typically under contract to determine <u>current</u> market value or "fair market value" of said industrial, utility, and related personal property. Fair market value is typically described as the price at which a property would sell for if:

- exposed in the open market with a reasonable time for the seller to find a purchaser;
- both the buyer and seller know of all the uses and purposes to which the property is, or can be, adapted and of the enforceable restrictions on its use; and

• both the buyer and seller seek to maximize their gains and neither is in a position to take advantage of the exigencies of the other. [Exigencies are pressing or urgent conditions that leave one party at a disadvantage to the other.]

For ad valorem tax purposes the effective date is usually legislatively specified by the particular State in which we are working - for example, in Texas the lien date is January 1 per the Texas Property Tax Code. For ad valorem tax purposes, the date of the appraisals and reports are typically several months past the effective date, thereby leaving open the possibility that a <u>retrospective</u> approach is appropriate under limited and prescribed circumstances (information after the effective date being applicable only if it confirms a trend or other appraisal condition that existed and was generally known as of the effective date).

P&A believes this section of this report, in conjunction with any attached or separately provided P&A-generated report(s), meets the USPAP definition of "typical practice"; i.e., it satisfies a level of work that is consistent with:

- the expectations of participants in the market for the same or similar appraisal services; and
- what P&A's peers' actions would be in performing the same or similar appraisal services in compliance with USPAP.

<u>Legal and Statutory Requirements</u>: The provisions of the Texas Property Tax Code and relevant legislative measures involving appraisal administration and procedures control the work of P&A as a subcontractor to the Appraisal District. P&A is responsible for appraising property on the basis of its market value as of January 1 for ad valorem tax purposes for each taxing unit that imposes ad valorem taxes on property in the contracted Appraisal District. All industrial, utility and personal properties are reappraised annually. The definition of Fair Market Value is provided and promulgated for use in ad valorem tax work in Texas by the Texas Property Tax Code, and therefore as a **Jurisdictional Exception** supercedes the definition of "market value" as found in USPAP definitions.

Administrative Requirements: P&A follows generally accepted and/or recognized appraisal practices and when applicable, the standards of the International Association of Assessing Officers (IAAO) regarding its appraisal practices and procedures. P&A, when applicable, also subscribes to the standards promulgated by the Appraisal Foundation known as the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP). In all cases where IAAO and/or USPAP requirements cannot be satisfied for reasons of practicality or irrelevancy, P&A subscribes to "generally accepted appraisal methods and techniques" so that its value conclusions are credible and defendable. P&A submits annual or biannual contract bids to the Office of the Chief Appraiser and is bound to produce appraisal estimates on industrial, utility and personal properties within the cost constraints of said bid. Any appraisal practices and procedures followed by P&A not explicitly defined through IAAO or USPAP requirements are specified by the Texas Property Tax Code and/or at the specific request or direction of the Office of the Chief Appraiser.

#### **Appraisal Resources**

<u>Personnel</u>: The Engineering Services Department and P&A's appraisal staff consists of appraisers with degrees in engineering, business and accounting. All personnel are Registered Professional Appraisers with the State of Texas, or are progressing towards this designation as prescribed by the Texas Department of Licensing and Regulation (TDLR).

<u>Data</u>: A set of data characteristics (i.e. original cost, year of acquisition, quantities, capacities, net operating income, property description, etc.) for each industrial, utility and personal property is collected from various

sources. This data is maintained in either hard copy or computer files. Each property's characteristic data drives the appropriate computer-assisted appraisal approach to valuation.

<u>Information Systems</u>: P&A's mainframe computer system is composed of in-house custom software augmented by schedules and databases that reside as various applications on personal computers (PC). P&A offers a variety of systems for providing property owners and public entities with information services.

#### VALUATION APPROACH (MODEL SPECIFICATION)

<u>Concepts of Value</u>: The valuation of industrial, utility and personal properties is not an exact science, and exact accuracy is not attainable due to many factors. These are considered complex properties and some are considered Special Purpose properties. Nevertheless, standards of reasonable performance do exist, and there are reliable means of measuring and applying these standards.

The evaluation and appraisal of industrial, utility and personal property relies heavily on the discovery of the property followed by the application of recognized appraisal techniques. The property is subject to inflation and depreciation in all forms. The appraisal of industrial and personal property involves understanding petroleum, chemical, steel, electrical power, lumber and paper industry processes along with a myriad of other industrial processes. Economic potential for this property usually follows either the specific industry or the general business economy. The appraisal of utility properties involves understanding telecommunications, electrical transmission and distribution, petroleum pipelines and the railroad industry. Utility properties are subject to regulation and economic obsolescence. The examination of utility property involves the understanding of the present value of future income in a regulated environment.

The goal for valuation of industrial, utility and personal properties is to appraise all taxable property at "fair market value". The Texas Property Tax Code defines Fair Market value as the price at which a property would transfer for cash or its equivalent under prevailing market conditions if:

- exposed for sale in the open market with a reasonable time for the seller to find a purchaser;
- both the seller and the purchaser know of all the uses and purposes to which the property is adapted and for which it is capable of being used and of the enforceable restrictions on its use; and
- both the seller and purchaser seek to maximize their gains and neither is in a position to take advantage of the exigencies of the other.

#### Approaches to Value for Industrial, Utility, and Personal Property

Cost Approach: The use of cost data in an appraisal for market value is based upon the economic principle of substitution. This method is most readily applicable to the appraisal of industrial and personal property and some utility property. Under this method, the market value of property equals the value of the land plus the current cost of improvements less accrued depreciation. An inventory of the plant improvements and machinery and equipment is maintained by personally inspecting each facility every year. As a general rule, and for the reasons stated above, Pritchard & Abbott, Inc., relies predominantly on the cost approach to value in the appraisal of industrial, utility, and personal property.

<u>Market Approach</u>: This approach is characterized as one that uses sales data available from actual transactions in the market place. There are two factors that severely limit the usefulness of the market approach for appraising industrial, utility and personal properties. First, the property sales data is seldom disclosed; consequently there

is insufficient market data for these properties available for meaningful statistical analysis. Second, all conditions of sale must be known and carefully investigated to be sure one does have a comparative indicator of value. Many times when these properties do change hands, it is generally through company mergers and acquisitions where other assets and intangibles in addition to the industrial, utility and personal property are involved. The complexity of these sales presents unique challenges and hindrances to the process of allocation of value to the individual components of the transaction.

In the case of industrial, utility and personal properties, a scarcity of sales requires that all evidence of market data be investigated and analyzed. Factors relative to the sale of these properties are:

- plant capacity and current production; terms of sale, cash or equivalent;
- complexity of property;
- · age of property;
- · proximity to other industry already operated by the purchaser; and
- other factors such as capital investment in the property.

As a general rule, and for the reasons stated above, Pritchard & Abbott, Inc., rarely employs a rigorous application of the market approach in the appraisal of industrial, utility, and personal property.

<u>Income Approach</u>: This approach to value most readily yields itself to all income generating assets, especially utility properties. Data for utility properties is available from annual reports submitted to regulatory agencies whereby future income may be estimated, and then this future income may be converted into an estimate of value. The valuation of an entire company by this method is sometimes referred to as a Unit Value. Many refer to this as a capitalization method, because capitalization is the process of converting an income stream into a capital sum (value). As with any method, the final value estimate is no better than the reliability of the input data. The underlying assumption is that people purchase the property for the future income the property will yield.

The relevant income that should be used in the valuation model is the expected future net operating income after depreciation but before interest expense (adjustments for Federal Income Taxes may or may not be required). Assumptions of this method are:

- Past income and expenses are a consideration, insofar as they may be a guide to future income, subject to regulation and competition.
- The economic life of the property can be estimated.
- The future production, revenues and expenses can be accurately forecasted. Future income is less valuable than current income, and so future net income must be discounted to make it equivalent to the present income. This discount factor reflects the premium of present money over future money, i.e., interest rate, liquidity, investment management, and risk.

As a general rule, and for the reasons stated above, Pritchard & Abbott, Inc., employs the income approach in the appraisal of industrial and utility property only when quantifiable levels of income are able to be reliably determined and/or projected for the subject property. P&A does not employ the income approach in the appraisal of personal property.

#### DATA COLLECTION/VALIDATION

Sources of Data: The main source of P&A's property data for industrial and personal property is through fieldwork by the appraisers and commercially/publicly available schedules developed on current costs. Data for

performing utility appraisals is typically provided by the taxpayer or is otherwise available at various regulatory agencies (Texas Railroad Commission, Public Utilities Commission, FERC, et. al.). Other discovery tools are financial data from annual reports, information from chief appraisers, renditions, tax assessors, trade publications and city and local newspapers. Other members of the public often provide P&A information regarding new industry and other useful facts related to property valuation.

<u>Data Collection Procedures</u>: Electronic and field data collection requires organization, planning and supervision of the appraisal staff. Data collection procedures have been established for industrial and personal properties. Appraisers gather and record information in the mainframe system, where customized programs serve as the basis for the valuation of industrial, utility and personal properties. P&A is divided into multiple district offices covering different geographic zones. Each office has a district manager and field staff. While overall standards of performance are established and upheld for the various district offices, quality of data is emphasized as the goal and responsibility of each appraiser. Additionally, P&A's Engineering Services Department provides supervision and guidance to all district offices to assist in maintaining uniform and consistent appraisal practices throughout the company.

#### VALUATION ANALYSIS (MODEL CALIBRATION)

The validity of the values by P&A's income and cost approaches to value is tested against actual market transactions, if and when these transactions and verifiable details of the transactions are disclosed to P&A. These transactions are checked for meeting all requisites of fair market value definition. Any conclusions from this analysis are also compared to industry benchmarks before being incorporated in the calibration procedure. Appropriate revisions of cost schedules and appraisal software are annually made and then tested for reasonableness prior to the appraisals being performed.

#### INDIVIDUAL VALUE REVIEW PROCEDURES

Individual property values are reviewed several times in the appraisal process. P&A's industrial, utility, personal property programs and appraisal spreadsheets afford the appraiser the opportunity to review the value being generated. Often the appraiser is prompted to reevaluate some or all of the parameters of data entry so as to arrive at a value more indicative of industry standards. Examples of indicators are original cost, replacement cost, service life, age, net operating income, capitalization rate, etc. In addition to appraiser review, taxpayers are afforded the opportunity to review the appraised values either before or after Notices of Appraised Value are prepared. Taxpayers, agents and representatives routinely meet with P&A's appraisers to review parameters and to provide data not readily available to P&A through public or commercial sources, such as investment costs and capitalization rate studies. And of course, all property values are subject to review through normal protest and Appraisal Review Board procedures, with P&A acting as a representative of the Office of the Chief Appraiser.

#### PERFORMANCE TESTS

An independent test of the appraisal performance of properties appraised by P&A is conducted by the State of Texas Comptroller's Office through the annual Property Value Study for school funding purposes. This study determines the degree of uniformity and the median level of appraisal for utility properties. School jurisdictions are given an opportunity to appeal any preliminary findings. After the appeal process is resolved, the Comptroller publishes a report of the findings of the study, including in the report the median level of appraisal, the coefficient of dispersion around the median level of appraisal and any other standard statistical measures that the Comptroller considers appropriate.